

Carolyn Shuster Fournier (Paris)

Remembering César Franck's Organ Class at the Paris Conservatory, His Impassioned Quest for Artistic Beauty

César Franck: A Worthy Heir to François Benoist and Alexis Chauvet in Promoting J. S. Bach's Works

César Franck (1822-1890) taught the organ at the Paris Conservatory for eighteen years, from 1872 to 1890. François Benoist preceded him as organ professor there from 1819 to 1872 and Charles-Marie Widor succeeded him from 1890 to 1896. What were the circumstances that led up to Franck's nomination in this institution sponsored by the French government? Who were his students? What were his pedagogical principles? How did they differ from those of his successor? Did he leave a legacy?

Much is known about the life of this child prodigy whose father, Nicolas Joseph Franck (1794-1871), a modest bank employee and an authoritarian amateur musician, had exploited his talents and those of his younger brother Joseph (1825-1891) after their musical education at the *Royal School of Music* in Liège.¹ It is certainly thanks to Pauline García that César Franck came to Paris to study privately with her professor, Anton Reicha.² They had met in Brussels on 25 April 1835. She had highly appreciated his agile and energetic accompaniments of her sister Maria Malibran. Two months later, from 24 June 1835 to 11 May 1836,³ like Pauline García, he embraced Reicha's free spirit, his vast Germanic cultural outlook, his interest in the writings of Kant and Aristotle, his faithfulness to past German masters, and his love of architectural compositional structure and canonic writing, manifest in his 36 *Fugues* (1805).

Equipped with this musical baggage, César Franck studied at the Paris Conservatory, where he won a First Grand Prize in Piano in 1838, a First Prize in Counterpoint and Fugue in 1840 and a Second Prize in Organ in 1841. This sufficed for his shrewd father, who made him leave the Conservatory on 22 April 1842 to earn his living as a music professor and a concert artist. Already beginning on October 1, 1838, at nearly the age of sixteen, like many artists who gave lessons in piano and harmony in the New Athens neighborhood, he had taught music with his brother Joseph in their home, at 22, rue Montholon, where his collective lessons⁴ were based on Anton Reicha's visionary artistic principles. He then gave music lessons at the *Collège Rollin* (now the Jacques-Decour *Collège-Lycée* [High School]), at the Augustinian College of the Assumption (234, faubourg Saint-Honoré), at an Institution for Young Girls in Auteuil, and beginning in the autumn of 1852, at the Jesuit [*Collège*] High School of the Immaculate Conception in Vaugirard, where Henri Duparc and Arthur Coquard experienced his "musical rhetoric." [rétorique musicale]⁵ [ORGELKUNST p. 169] His assiduous teaching enabled him to escape his father's exploitation of his talents. He married one of his students, Félicité Desmousseaux, on 22 February 1848 at the Notre-Dame de Lorette Church, where he had been the choir organist since 1845. His son Georges was born at the end of this year. Franck felt very comfortable in this "New Athens" neighborhood where cosmopolitan artists such as Frédéric Chopin, Charles-Valentin Alkan, Franz Liszt, le Chevalier Sigismund Neukomm and his piano professor, Pierre Zimmermann, played J. S. Bach's music. On 15 May 1851, the year he was appointed titular organist of the Cavaillé-Coll organ in the Saint-Jean-Saint-François Church, Aristide Cavaillé-Coll installed his first organ with a 30-note German-style pedalboard in Pauline García-Viardot's home at 48, rue de Douai. Nine months later, on 16 January 1852, these musicians all attended Jacques-Nicolas Lemmens' performance of Bach's works on the Cavaillé-Coll organ at the Saint-Vincent-de-Paul Church. Following this concert, François Benoist wrote to Aristide Cavaillé-Coll:

That which especially struck me was this calm and religious greatness and this severe style which is so appropriate to the majesty of God's temple. [...] It is a great merit, in my viewpoint, to rest faithful to the traditions of the grand masters who, in the past century, had founded the true art of the organ.

[Ce qui m'a frappé, c'est cette grandeur calme et religieuse et cette sévérité de style qui conviennent si bien à la majesté du temple de Dieu. [...] C'est un grand mérite, à mes yeux, que de rester fidèle aux traditions des grands maîtres qui, dans le siècle dernier, ont fondé le véritable art de l'orgue.]⁶

Franck had lived at 69, rue Blanche, in the same building as Adèle Blanc, who married Cavaillé-Coll on 4 February 1854, in the second chapel of the Sainte-Trinité Church.⁷ On 19 December 1859, he became titular organist of the new Cavaillé-Coll organ at the Sainte-Clotilde Church, located in the Faubourg Saint-Germain. In 1862, when his melody *Souvenance* [Remembrance] was published, he thanked Pauline Viardot by dedicating it to her.⁸

One must remember that Alexis Chauvet had been destined to succeed François Benoist as organ professor at the Paris Conservatory. An extremely talented organist, composer and professor, Chauvet had won three First Prizes, in Organ, Fugue and Composition, at the Paris Conservatory, where he assisted Ambroise Thomas in the teaching of his class. His *Twenty Pieces* for organ, published in 1862 and dedicated to François Benoist, manifest the influence of Bach and the French classical composers; like Alexandre Boëly's music, they are linked to both the German and French schools. Six years later, when Franck's *Six Pieces*, composed between 1858-1862, were published, they were dedicated to his close friends: Alexis Chauvet, Camille Saint-Saëns, Charles-Valentin Alkan, Louis James Alfred Lefébure-Wély, François Benoist and Aristide Cavaillé-Coll. Both Chauvet's and Franck's collections had truly resurrected the great art of the organ in France.⁹ Both of them had performed in Cavaillé-Coll's workshops and inaugurated his organs, those at the Notre-Dame Cathedral on 6 March 1868 and at the Sainte-Trinité Church on 16 March 1869, where Chauvet was appointed titular organist on 24 March. Thanks to Chauvet's highly esteemed advice, Cavaillé-Coll's Great Organ and Choir Organ at the Sainte-Trinité Church both had 30-note pedalboards. Nicknamed "little Father Bach," [le petit Père Bach,]¹⁰ Chauvet's *Fifteen Preparatory Studies to the Works of Bach* (1867) had initiated his students to this great master's polyphony. The Leipzig Bach Society published the Bach *Gesellschaft* between 1851 and 1899. Bach's organ works became available in 1864 to Parisian subscribers, such as Alkan, Chauvet, Pauline Viardot and Saint-Saëns. In 1865, E. Repos published Joseph Franck's editions of 22 Bach Preludes and Fugues. Unfortunately, the Paris Conservatory's organ students had not been able to acquire an excellent pedal technique, necessary for performing Bach's organ works, simply because its Grenié studio organ (1819) only had a 20-note pedalboard which was "too large and disproportionate." [d'une division trop large et disproportionnée]¹¹

In 1853, Pierre Érard constructed concert pianos with a 32-note pedalboard, with a *ravalement* that began at A, using a system that was coupled to the low notes of the piano. In 1855, both Pauline Viardot's organ and Érard's *piano-pédalier* were promoted at the World's Fair. On the *piano-pédalier*, Alkan performed Bach's virtuosic *Tocatta in F Major*, which highlighted two pedal solos. In this same year Bach's *Fugue in E Minor* was a required work for the Paris Conservatory's organ competition. In 1858, the Niedermeyer School imposed Bach's *Passacaglia* at its final organ exam. Cavaillé-Coll had applied a pedalboard to an upright piano¹² and Franck had purchased a Pleyel vertical pedalboard (N° 25 655),¹³ which, "instead of merely coupling the piano keys to the pedals, was completely independent, with its own strings, hammers and mechanism."¹⁴ Chauvet had installed one in a painting studio where he taught. Franck taught on one at the *Collège* in Vaugirard, in a small room with stained glass windows.¹⁵

Many have forgotten that in 1870 the Conservatory had ordered two Cavaillé-Coll organs,¹⁶ one with three 61-note keyboards and seventeen stops for the *Société des Concerts* Hall, contracted on 26 September 1870, and the other with 56-note three manuals and 26 stops, contracted on 5 November 1870, the same day that Victor Hugo had returned to Paris from exile, to replace the insufficient Grenié studio organ. Chauvet had certainly advised that these organs possess a 30-note pedalboard. Unfortunately, he died of a lung infection on 29 January 1871 during the Prussian siege of Paris, just one week after the death of Franck's father in Aix-la-Chapelle and three days after the armistice had been signed. Charles Gounod lamented his death on 13 March in London:

In London, I learned at this very instant through one of my friends of the death of poor Chauvet, organist of the Great Organ of our parish. This is a great loss! There are few Chauvets, unfortunately.

[J'apprends à Londres, à l'instant même, par un de mes amis la mort du pauvre Chauvet, organiste du grand orgue de notre paroisse ! C'est une grande perte ! Il y a peu de Chauvet, malheureusement.]¹⁷ [ORGELKUNST, p. 171]

Esprit Auber, the Director of the Paris Conservatory also passed away on 5 May 1871, during the revolutionary government that had been instituted on 18 March. Ambroise Thomas succeeded him, after Gounod had refused to direct the Conservatory. Twenty-three days later, a week of bloody violence ended the Commune. Franck, a “moderate Republican” [Républicain modéré]¹⁸ remained in Paris during difficult period. On 25 February 1871, Franck had contributed to the founding of the *Société nationale de musique*, which aspired to give birth to new French music.

How did Franck succeed François Benoist? It is well-known that Aristide Cavallé-Coll, Camille Saint-Saëns and Théodore Dubois supported his nomination as organ professor at the Paris Conservatory. On 21 August, he had written to Charles Blanc, the Director of Fine Arts, to notify him that he could replace François Benoist.¹⁹ One must remember that on 1 October 1871, his friend Pauline Viardot was appointed Voice Professor at the Paris Conservatory. Charles Blanc and his brother, Louis, a socialist and Republican politician, were both friends of Pauline’s husband, Louis Viardot, an eminent art collector. The Viardots and Louis Blanc had just seen each other in London. On 12 November 1871, a decree by the President of the Republic granted Franck the rights to reside in France.²⁰ On 31 January, Jules Simon signed a decree for the General Secretary of the State Department of Public Instruction of Worship and the Fine Arts which stipulated that Franck would be appointed as organ professor there.²¹ Benoist retired on the next day, 1 February 1872. However, Ambroise Thomas only officially appointed Franck to succeed him, after he had received, on 17 February 1872, the official letter from Charles Blanc, indicating that César Franck’s appointment as organ professor. Franck then 49 years old, had been nominated for this eminent post, in spite of the fact that he had only received a Second Prize in Organ there, unlike his brother Joseph, who had received a First Prize in Benoist’s class in 1852.

The Two New Cavallé-Coll Organs at the Paris Conservatory

Unfortunately, the violence in the capital had drastically reduced the Conservatory’s funds. Constructing two new organs was out of the question. Since the Grenié studio organ was unplayable, the Conservatory had asked Cavallé-Coll to revise it and to construct another one for the Conservatory’s *Société des Concerts* Hall, using elements from Sébastien Érard’s *Château de la Muette* organ (1830), which his daughter-in-law, Madame Pierre Érard, had given to the Conservatory in 1863. The construction of the 17-stop Concert Hall Organ was delayed: it began on 31 August 1871 but was only finished on 5 October 1872. Cavallé-Coll had encountered some difficulties in installing this organ. The concert hall, constructed in a parallelogram shape, of wood covered with painted canvasses, had excellent acoustics. However in 1866 Alexis-Joseph Mazerolle had redecorated it by placing irremovable panels in the Pompeian style of the Second Empire, that were 8.5 meters high at the back of the stage. This stage was reserved for the declamation classes and the only possible place to install the organ without bothering the scene shifters was

was behind the decorative panels at the back of the stage, where an insufficient opening was found which would allow it to be seen as a half-length portrait, as in a Guignol theater.

[derrière le décor du fond de la scène, où se trouve percée une insuffisante ouverture qui le fera voir à mi-corps, comme un théâtre de Guignol.]²²

According to Jules Lissajous, it was placed in a limited space, in axis with the stage, at the height of the first balcony and the access to its pipework and mechanics was difficult since:

the instrument was entirely separated from the Hall by a rotunda which formed the stage and which encircled the amphitheater where a notable part of the Société des Concerts’ orchestra was placed, the sound not coming from this side, resounds from the openings on the upper sides of the stage and is lost in the ceilings and in the hallways and, to make it these circumstances worse, a ceiling sagged in two is suspended at a rather short distance in front of the organ and immediately blocks the sound waves which emanate from the expression box.

[L’instrument est séparé entièrement de la Salle par la rotonde qui forme la scène et entoure l’amphithéâtre où est placé une notable partie de l’orchestre de la société des concerts, le son n’ayant pas d’issue de ce côté, s’échappe par les ouvertures latérales et supérieures de

la scène et va se perdre dans les combles et dans les couloirs et, par une malheureuses, un plafond ployé en deux est suspendu à peu de distance de la face de l'orgue et forme obstacle immédiat à la propagation des ondes sonores qui sortent de la boîte d'expression.]²³

This organ had the following console layout:²⁴ [ORGELKUNST p. 172]

Unfortunately, due to the immobile panels, the sound of the organ was absolutely insufficient to accompany singers. Aristide Cavaillé-Coll was very disappointed, especially since he was then building a monumental 64-stop concert organ for the city of Sheffield in England, installed in 1873. Unfortunately, due to the Commune, the French Government had to wait until 1878 to finance the construction of the organ for the Concert Hall of the Trocadéro Festival Hall. In the meantime, Cavaillé-Coll observed that

the delay justified by the extent of the work on the *grand orgue*, nevertheless would not have resulted in any loss to the administration, since in this manner, the organ class was able to continue on the former studio organ, until the installation of the *grand orgue* on which the students may continue to work during the reparations of the studio organ.

[le retard motivé par l'importance du travail du grand orgue, n'aura cependant causé aucun préjudice à l'administration, vu que de cette manière, la classe d'orgue a pu se continuer sur l'ancien orgue d'étude, en attendant la pose du grand orgue sur lequel les élèves pourront travailler lors des réparations de l'orgue d'étude.]²⁵

The organ room was located just behind the stage of the concert hall, as illustrates this layout: [ORGELKUNST t p. 172]

After his nomination in 1872, Franck therefore taught on the concert hall organ from February to June and began teaching on the studio organ in October, since it was reconstructed between 23 February and installed on 7 October in the organ room,²⁶ a small eighteenth-century *rococo*-style "theater" where Benoist had taught. Its pipes were placed in an expressive swell box to protect them from accumulating dust often found in theaters. It had new mechanical action keyboards but its former wind-chests and nine and a half of its 16 stops, excluding its free reeds, had been retained:

Grand-Orgue under expression, 54 notes: Flûte 8', Dessus de Flûte Harmonique 8' (30 n.),

Bourdon 8', Dessus de Prestant 4' (30 n.), Flûte 4', Trompette 8';

Récit under expression, 54 notes: Principal 8', Flûte Traversière 8', Voix Céleste 8',

Flûte Octaviant 4', Trompette 8', Basson and Hautbois 8';

Pédale under expression, 30 notes: Soubasse 16', Flûte 8', Flûte 4', Basson 8';

Pédales de combinaison: Tirasse Grand-Orgue, Tirasse Récit, Copula Récit sur Grand-Orgue, Expression.

This "wretched cuckoo of an organ," [méchant coucou d'orgue]²⁷ was activated by pulling a stop labeled as a "Bell" [Sonnette] and one stop remained *Tacet*. Its expression was activated by a hitch-down pedal with two notches located on the lower right side of the console, as shown in its layout:²⁸ [ORGELKUNST p. 173]

Thankfully, both of these organs were equipped with an indispensable 30-note pedalboard. On 29 December 1872, Franck had performed a Bach *Prelude and Fugue in E Minor* for the *Société des Concerts*. On the organ this time, he was invisible to the auditors. Naturalized as a French citizen on 10 March 1873, his teaching would cross the fraternal bridge linking French and German music.²⁹ Alexandre Cellier speaks about the Concert Hall Organ in 1927:

In the hall of the former Conservatory, it's the poor old instrument with 16 stops placed too high and muffled by an imposturous décor, which must struggle against 70 to 80 musicians and if the disproportion is less grand elsewhere, it does not place the organ in such a position of inferiority with the orchestra.

[Dans la salle de l'ancien Conservatoire, c'est un pauvre vieil instrument de 16 jeux placé trop haut et assourdi par une imposte du décor, qui doit lutter avec 70 à 80 musiciens et si la disproportion est moins grande ailleurs, elle n'en place pas moins encore l'orgue dans un état d'infériorité vis-à-vis de l'orchestre.]³⁰

Unfortunately both of these organs seem to have disappeared.

César Franck Approach to Teaching – The Technique Should Serve Artistry and Musicality

Franck, “a model functionary,” [fonctionnaire modèle]³¹ punctually³² taught the organ at the Paris Conservatory on the rue Bergère six hours each week, during two hour long sessions on three days.³³ These collective lessons, with both male and female students, mirrored the ones he had given in his home in 1838, which enabled students to listen to each other and to their professor. As in the past under François Benoist, his students took two semestrial exams, at the end of January and June, during which they accompanied a plainchant in four-parts, improvised a four-part fugue and a free piece in sonata form, both based on themes chosen by the examiners, and played “a classic piece” of their choice by memory. In 1852, this memorized piece was a fugue; in 1867, it became a Bach fugue; in 1872, a classical piece.³⁴ Franck's duty was to prepare his students to pass their exams. Prior to these exams, Franck received a report that indicated each student's name, age and year of study and previous awards in the class, on which he briefly evaluated, in a blank space that measured 1.5 by 4.5 inches, the student's progress and indicated the piece he or she would play during the exam, which allowed for the preparation of the scores for the jury members. If they approved a student's progress, they could award either a Second or First *Accessits* [Certificates of Merit]. After each year's final exam, a “competition” was held for advanced students, who could obtain either a Second or First Prize. Although these exams and competitions were closed to the public, their results could have a real impact on the future career of each student.

While much has been said about Franck's students who won First or Second Prizes, little is known about the rest of his class. Here is a list of the students who enrolled in his class: their dates, the period they were enrolled and their awards:

Franck's Enrolled Students at the Paris Conservatory³⁵

Abbreviations: **2A** (2nd *accessit*), **1A** (1st *accessit*), **2P** (2nd Prize), **1P** (1st Prize)

Students who began with Benoist and who continued with Franck:

Georges Deslandres (1849-1875) 1868: **1A**/1868, remained until 1872

Paul Rougnon (1846-1934) 1868-1872

Paul Wachs (1851-1915) 1869: **2P**/1870, **1P**/1872

Bazile Benoît (1847-after 1900) 1868: **2A**/1872, remained until 1873

Samuel Rousseau (1853-1904) 1871: **2A**/1872, **1A**/1875, **2P**/1876, **1P**/1877

Francis Thomé (1850-1909) 1871-1873

Students who studied entirely with Franck:

Jean Tolbecque (1857-1890) 21 Nov. 1872: **1A**/1873

Joseph Humblot (1845-after 1900) 1872: **1A**/1873, **2P**/1874

Marie-Antoinette [nicknamed Thérèse] **Gaillard** (1850-after 1900) 9 Nov. 1872-7 June 1873

Adèle Billault (1848-after 1900) 20 Dec. 1872-11 June 1875

Amédée Dutacq (1848-1929) January 1874-12 October 1874

Vincent d'Indy (1851-1931) [studied privately with Franck beginning on 13 October 1872 and was an auditor in his class before officially enrolling in it on 14 Jan. 1874: **2A**/1874, **1A**/1875

Léon-Gustave-Joseph Karren (1854-1920) Feb. 1875-1876

Georges Verschneider (1854-1895) 1873: **2A**/1874, **1A**/1875, remained until 1879

Marie Renaud [Madame Maury] (1852-1928) Jan. 1874: **2A**/1875, **1A**/1876, remained until June 1877

Louise Genty (born in 1850) Jan. 1875: **2A**/1876

Camille Benoît 1875-1876

Marie-Anne Papot (1855-1896) Jan. 1876: **2A**/1876, **1A**/1878, **2P**/1879, remained until Dec. 1880

Clément Jules Broutin (1851-1900) Oct. 1877-June 1878

Georges Hüe (1858-1948) Dec. 1878-June 1879
Henri Dallier (1849-1934) Nov. 1876: **1P/1878**
Georges Marty (1860-1908) Dec. 1878-June 1879
Auguste Chapuis (1858-1933) Dec. 1878: **1A/1879, 2A/1880, 1P/1881**
Jean Louis Lapuchin (1850-1895?) Dec. 1878-Jan. 1879
Théophile Sourilas (1850-1907) Jan. 1880: **1A/1880**, remained until July 1881
Gabriel Pierné (1863-1937) Dec.1880: **2P/1881, 1P/1882**
Louis Ganne (1862-1923) Dec. 1880: **1A/1882**
Paul Jeannin (1858-1887) Auditor/1880, Dec. 1881: **1A/1882**
Lucien Grandjany (1862-1891) Dec. 1881: **2P/1882, 1P/1883**
Henri Charles Kaiser (1861-1920?) Dec. 1881: **2A/1882, 2P/1883, 1P/1884**
Frédéric Duplessis (born in 1858) Dec. 1881
Marcel Rouher (1857-1940) Nov. 1882-1885
Léonie Guinrange [Madame E. Rouher] (1858-1900) Dec. 1883-Jan. 1885
Louis Landry (born in 1867) Nov. 1882: **1A/1884**, remained until June 1886
Carlos Mesquita (born in 1864) Dec. 1883: **2A/1884, 1A/1885**, remained until Jan. 1886
François Pinot (1865-1891) Nov. 1884: **1P/1885**
Aimé Féry (born in 1862) Dec. 1885-June 1887
Émile Fournier (1864-1897) 4 October 1885-June 1886
Louis Frémaux (born in 1867) Dec. 1885
Dynam-Victor Fumet (1867-1949) Dec. 1885
Georges Aubry (1868-1939) Dec. 1885: **2A/1888**, remained until July 1889
Henri Letocart (1866-1945) Dec. 1885: **2A/1887**, remained until June 1890
Alfred Georges Bachelet (1864-1944) Dec. 1885-1887-1888
Louis d'Arnal de Serres (1864-1942) Oct. 1885-1888
Albert Pillard (1867-1943) Dec. 1886-June 1888
Édouard Bopp (born in 1866, Switzerland) Dec. 1887-Jan. 1888
Jean-Joseph Jemain (1864-1954) Jan. 1885: **2A/1886, 1A/1887**
Adolphe Marty (1865-1942) Dec. 1886: **1P/1886**
Hedwige Chrétien [Madame P. Gennaro] (1859-1944) Dec. 1886-Jan. 1887
Georges Bondon (1867-after 1900) Dec. 1885: **2P/1887, 1P/1889**
Cesar[ino] Galeotti (Italy 1872-Paris 1929) Dec. 1885: **1P/1887**
Joséphine Boulay (1869-1925) Dec. 1887: **1P/1888**
Marie Prestat (1862-1933) Dec. 1887: **2A/1888, 1A/1889, 1P/1890**
Jean-Ferdinand Schneider (1864-1934) Dec. 1887-June 1889
Bruno Maurel (1867-after1900) Dec. 1887-Jan. 1889
Albert Mahaut (1867-1943) Dec. 1888: **1P/1889**

Students who began with Franck and continued with Widor:

Achille Runner (1870-1938?) Dec. 1888: **2P/1893**, remained until June 1895
Paul Ternisien (born in 1870) Dec. 1888-June 1892
Georges Guiraud (1868-1928) Dec. 1889-June 1891
André-Paul Burgat (1865-1900) Dec. 1889-June 1891
Jules Bouval (1867-1914) Dec. 1889: **2A/1891**, remained until June 1894
Henri Büsser (1872-1974) Dec. 1889-Jan. 1893
Henri Libert (1869-1937) Dec. 1889: **2A/1892, 1P/1894**
Charles Tournemire (1870-1939) Dec. 1889: **1A/1889, 1P/1891**
[Louis Vierne (1870-1937) auditor (1889), enrolled on 4 Oct. 1890 or 16 Jan. 1891: **2A/1891, 2P/1892, 1P/1894]**³⁶

In 1872, the six students enrolled in his class had studied with François Benoist. For the next thirteen years his class fluctuated from two to eight students. Just six years after he began to teach the organ, he applied to teach composition instead of organ and had hoped to succeed François Bazin, who had died on 2 July 1878. However, Jules Massenet was appointed as Bazin's successor and Franck continued to teach the organ there. Thankfully, in the autumn of 1885, his class had grown from four to twelve students and leveled

off to about ten pupils per year. Franck's initial salary of 1,500 francs rose to 2,400 francs.³⁷ This increase was partially due to his successful organ recital³⁸ on 1 October 1878 at the monumental 5,000-seat Trocadéro Festival Hall during the World's Fair, which had reaffirmed his reputation as "an artist at the forefront of organ teachers in France."³⁹ Foreign organists entered his class: the Brazilian Carlos Mesquita, the Swiss Édouard Bopp and the Italian Cesarino Galeotti, his favorite and youngest student, who won his First Prize in Organ at the age of fifteen.

Six of his students (Paul Wachs, François Pinot, Émile Fournier, Georges Guiraud, Henri Letocart and Henri Büsser) had previously received a complete musical training in the Niedermeyer School of Classical and Religious Music, a boarding school located at 10, rue Neuve-Fontaine-Saint-Georges (today rue Fromentin). Founded in 1853, it thoroughly trained church musicians, offering courses in solfège, piano, organ, plainchant, harmony, counterpoint, fugue, accompaniment, music history and vocal ensemble. These students had acquired the eight volumes of the Peter's Edition of J. S. Bach's organ works and played them daily,⁴⁰ as well as great classical works by Palestrina, Handel, Mendelssohn, Saint-Saëns...⁴¹ When Clément Loret, a former Lemmens' student in Brussels, began to teach there in 1858, his *Organ Method* had appeared in the school's journal, *La Maîtrise*. It included exercises in manual substitutions and glissandi as well as the use of both toes and heels in order to play legato. According to Lemmens, "a good method for pedaling was as necessary as a good fingering to properly play the organ." [une bonne méthode pour l'emploi de la pédale est aussi nécessaire qu'un bon doigté pour le jeu de l'orgue proprement dit.]⁴² Loret's method explained how an organ functioned, and taught them to transpose, to accompany plainchants and to improvise. Students could practice on small Cavaillé-Coll organs, on the fifteen pianos and even on a piano with a pedalboard at their school, and in Cavaillé-Coll's workshops, where they occasionally gave concerts.⁴³ At the end of the 1880s, Loret's student Aloÿs Kunc taught students in Toulouse who then entered Franck's class: Dynam-Victor Fumet, Henri Büsser, Georges Guiraud and Jules Bouval. In 1889, when Büsser went to meet Franck at the Sainte-Clotilde Basilica to show him his recent exams in harmony, fugue and composition at the Niedermeyer School, Franck told him,

Young man, you seem to be very talented, come tomorrow morning to my class at the Paris Conservatory and, without doubt, I will make something of you.

[Jeune homme, vous me paraissez bien doué, venez demain matin au Conservatoire à ma classe et, sans doute, ferons-nous quelque chose de vous.]⁴⁴

The next day, Büsser played him a Mendelssohn sonata, a Bach fugue, and then improvised on a free theme that the master had given him. Franck then told him, "I think that you may enter my class as a student, after the examination in January." [Je pense que vous pourrez être reçu élève dans ma classe, après l'examen de Janvier.]⁴⁵

Four of Franck's students (Adolphe Marty, Albert Mahaut, Joséphine Boulay and Louis Vierne) had studied at the National Institute for Blind Youth⁴⁶ with Louis-Bon Lebel (1831-1888), who used Lemmens' Organ Method to teach pedal technique. Around 1875, Franck had become the inspector of musical studies there and the president of the final exams at the end of each year.⁴⁷ Students worked rigorously and practiced four or five hours each day on their two Cavaillé-Coll studio organs, one in the boys' quarters and the other in the girls' quarters. In 1883, Cavaillé-Coll built a 36-stop three-manual organ for their chapel, decorated by the painter Henri Lehmann, a friend of Franz Liszt, which also served as a concert hall when movable panels enlarged the room. For this organ's inauguration on 17 March 1883, Franck had composed his *Psalms* CL for choir, organ and orchestra, in which Louis Vierne had played the timpani.

Some of Franck's students came from musical families. Paul Wachs' father was a composer and choirmaster at Saint-Merri. Georges Deslandres' father Laurent and his brother Adolphe were musicians at the Sainte-Marie-des-Batignolles Church, his brother Jules-Laurent was a bass player and his sister Clémence was a singer. Samuel Rousseau's father was a harmonium manufacturer in Paris. Georges Verschneider came from a family of three generations of organ builders active from 1760-1900 in Moselle. Hedwige Chrétien was the granddaughter of the violinist J. Ternisien. Jean Tolbecque came from a family of French-Belgian musicians. His father Auguste was a cellist and composer who taught at the Marseille Conservatory from 1865-1871; a friend of Camille Saint-Saëns and Ambroise Thomas, he had acquired an organ for his early instrument collection installed in the Fort-Foucault in Niort in 1875.⁴⁸ Henri Letocart's father Joseph was a music professor.

Among Franck's 63 enrolled students, seventeen were awarded First Prizes; two received Second Prizes; ten, First *Accessits*; four, Second *Accessits* and 29 received no awards at all. Those who received no award had not studied harmony or counterpoint, were not talented, lacked intelligence and could not improvise (Léon Karren, Clément Broutin, Jean Lapuchin, Émile Fournier, Amédée Dutacq, Georges Deslandres, Louis Landry and Henri Letocart). These students could escape to a small room situated underneath the organ to help Jean Lescot, the Conservatory's janitor, pump the organ's wind bellows.⁴⁹ Some became ill (Albert Pillard, Jean-Ferdinand Schneider, Georges Aubry, Georges Verscheider, Louis de Serres and Léonie Guinrange). Others were talented, conscientious and had studied accompaniment or composition, but were too busy to practice (Alfred Bachelet, Francis Thomé, Aimé Féry, Louis Frémaux, Paul Ternisien, Louis Ganne, Paul Jeannin). Some students specialized in other instruments, such as the pianist Bazille Benoît and the cellist Jean Tolbecque. Joseph Humblot was his only organ student who improvised very well but he had difficulty performing. Other excellent students with high-level musical intelligence worked hard, interpreted well, but had difficulty improvising, such as Louise Genty, Marie Renaud, Théophile Sourilas, Georges Verscheider and Vincent d'Indy. Both Vincent d'Indy and Marie Renaud had only received a First *Accessit*. D'Indy was very bitter about this and spoke rather unkindly about his fellow students in his *Journal*.⁵⁰ He left Franck's organ class but continued to study composition privately with him. Marie Renaud, one of Franck's ten female students, was the first woman to win a First Prize in Counterpoint and Fugue (1876) at the Conservatory. Unfortunately, she could not compete for the *Grand Prix de Rome* because it was forbidden to women until 1903. She was also the first woman to be a member of the *Société nationale de musique*.

Those who had successfully won First Prizes in Organ had also studied harmony, counterpoint, fugue and composition in order to become complete musicians. All of Franck's students who had studied at the National Institute for Blind Youth had won a First Prize in Organ: Adolphe Marty, Albert Mahaut and Joséphine Boulay quickly received it, due to their excellent training. In 1888, Boulay was Franck's first female student to win a First Prize in Franck's organ class. Marie Prestat was the first woman to obtain five First Prizes at the Conservatory (in Harmony, Accompaniment, Composition, Fugue and Counterpoint and Organ). Henri Dallier also earned his First Prize very quickly, because he had studied at the Reims Cathedral Choir School and had been choir organist there.

To prepare his students for their exams, Franck taught his students to accompany plainchants given in whole notes with very free developments in four-part florid counterpoint, with the cantus firmus placed in the bass and the three voices above it.⁵¹ The suppleness of the chants, such as the *Stabat mater*, *Dies irae* or *Jesu Redemptor*, gave birth to beautiful improvisations and compositions in all forms. Franck desired that the embellishments of these admirable melodies be musically expressive, in order to bring them to life.⁵² When the organ room was occupied by exams, he taught the accompaniment of plainchant on a piano in another room. With indulgence, patience, severity and austerity, Franck taught improvisation five out of the six hours of his organ class each week,⁵³ according to the Conservatory's imposed straitjacket regulations. To improvise a strict four-voice "*fugue d'école*," students had to listen carefully to Franck's severe advice in order to strictly follow a set architectural plan and construct fugues solidly and harmoniously, with an absolute pureness of style. After exposing the theme in four voices, they chose a countersubject with entries in the outer voices and developed a stretto toward the end. The free improvisations used a one-theme exposition, which, after a bridge, subtly introduced a new element during the transition to the dominant, which could later serve during the development, before the recapitulation in the tonic. As in François Benoist's class, the themes provided during his class were sometimes taken from Haydn's and Mozart's symphonies, but during their exams, students improvised on popular tunes from operettas. However, from January 1879 to June 1887 fugue subjects and modern themes were composed specially for the exams⁵⁴ by Auguste Bazille, Jules Cohen, Léo Delibes, Théodore Dubois, Henri Fissot, Alexandre Guilmant, Ambroise Thomas.⁵⁵

[ORGELKUNST p. 177]

Franck encouraged his students to improvise with "melodic invention, harmonic discoveries, subtle modulations, and elegant figurations:"⁵⁶

He did not stop the student who was developing a Gregorian theme or another free or imposed one, a fugue, a sonata movement with florid counterpoint, several interjections, launched with a vibrant loud bursting voice, sometimes with a tremendous *crescendo* to impose the order of a development, a tonality, a modulation, to prevent the apprentice organist from getting lost in

the contrapuntal plan, to proclaim criticism or praise: 'Modulate!... Some flats!!! Some sharps!!! E in the bass, in the tonal key... Something else! I don't love that! I love that!

[Il n'arrêtait pas l'élève en train d'élaborer sur un thème grégorien ou autre, libre ou imposé, une fugue, un morceau de sonate aux contrepunts fleuris ; quelques interjections, lancées d'une grosse voix vibrante, éclatante, parfois en « un *crescendo* formidable », pour imposer un ordre de développement, de tonalité, de modulation, pour empêcher l'apprenti organiste de s'égarer dans le maquis contrapuntique, pour lancer critique ou éloge : 'Modulez !... Des bémols !... Des dièses !... *Mi* à la basse ! Au ton !... Autre chose !... Je n'aime pas !... J'aime !']⁵⁷

According to Maurice Emmanuel,

One should see one of Franck's lessons in this small half-obscured theater, where the master's beautiful voice resonated like a deep bell, at one moment detailing the exercise underway, and at another moment expressing, with general ideas, the preference of the musician. Severe when supervising the construction of a fugue, he wanted this rhetoric to be as less hollow as possible. 'First search for a beautiful countersubject,' he said... And the student, invited to discover one on his own, was not always able to invent one. Then Franck took his place on the oak bench and demonstrated one in grand style - 'And here's a second one! And a third one!... And yet another one!' The students were confounded... The same tactic for the 'divertissements.' Those which the young beginning 'fugue improvisers' came up with were not always to his liking; therefore, his hands ran to the keyboards, substituting an example for the precept. While this pedagogical method was perhaps insufficient for many students, who had only applied, desired or were waiting for precise recipes. This eloquent persuasive model was addressed to the worthy disciple who could understand it and who was capable of becoming inspired by it.

It is especially while exercising free improvisation that Franck applied this method. It was as good as any other. He created in front of his students a "verse" or a more developed piece in order to enable them to succeed in the double exam on the day of competition. He gave his students practical precepts and was very severe concerning the choice and order of modulations. He had magistral ideas concerning them. But all things considered, 'Listen to me,' he cried; or even, unsatisfied with the resources that the small old organ in the class offered him, he said to his students: 'Come to Sainte-Clotilde on Sunday. I will demonstrate this to you.'

[Il faut se représenter une des leçons de Franck dans ce petit théâtre, obscur à moitié, où la belle voix du maître résonnait comme une cloche grave, tantôt détaillant l'exercice en train, tantôt exprimant, en idées générales, les prédilections du musicien. Sévère à surveiller l'agencement d'une fugue, il voulait que cette rhétorique fût le moins creuse possible. 'Cherchons d'abord un beau contre-sujet,' disait-il... Et comme l'élève, invité à réaliser cette trouvaille, ne se montrait pas toujours un inventeur heureux, Franck, glissant le long du banc de chêne, se substituait à lui et découvrait incontinent un contre-sujet de grand style. 'En voici un second ! Et un troisième !... Et un autre encore !' Les élèves étaient confondus... Même tactique pour les 'divertissements'. Ceux qui les apprentis fuguistes commettaient n'étaient pas toujours de son goût : alors ses mains couraient sur le clavier, substituant au précepte l'exemple. Moyen pédagogique peut-être insuffisant avec maint élève, qui n'étant qu'appliqué, désire et attend des recettes précises. Modèle éloquent, persuasif, à l'adresse du disciple digne de le comprendre et capable de s'en inspirer.

C'était surtout dans l'exercice de l'improvisation libre que Franck appliquait cette méthode. Elle ne vaut une autre. Il créait devant ses élèves un « verset » ou une pièce plus développée, afin de les entraîner à triompher, le jour du concours, en cette double épreuve. Des préceptes pratiques étaient fournis par lui à ses élèves ; il se montrait fort sévère sur le choix et sur l'ordre des modulations. Il avait là-dessus des idées magistrales. Mais en fin de compte, « écoutez-moi », s'écrivait-il ; ou bien, peu satisfait des ressources que le petit vieil orgue de la classe lui offrait, il disait aux élèves, 'Venez dimanche à Sainte-Clotilde. Je vous *montrerais*.']⁵⁸

Gabriel Pierné, Louis de Serres and Louis Vierne observed that “no form of teaching could be livelier: his playing was magnificent, seductive, leading the student to his utmost potential....” [nulle forme d’enseignement ne pouvait être plus vivante : c’était un jeu magnifique, séduisant, entraînant à l’extrême....]⁵⁹ Franck did not need to resort to words to express his thoughts, which he could more fully expressed by music.⁶⁰ Therefore, he played various solutions to show them how to develop a good fugue.⁶¹ According to Augusta Holmès, who studied composition with him beginning in 1875,

he never substituted his own manner of thinking for that of his students. After having opened the way, he let them entirely follow their own initiative.

[il ne se substituait jamais sa propre manière de penser à celle de ses élèves. Après leur avoir ouvert la voie, il les laissait entièrement livrés à leur propre initiative.]⁶²

Maurice Emmanuel emphasized this:

As necessary as it may be, the *form* is not sufficient. It only constitutes a framework. And the most beautiful technique in the world can remain a dead letter if it is not used to serve an idea.

[Si nécessaire qu’elle soit, la *forme* n’est pas suffisante. Elle ne constitue qu’une charpente. Et la plus belle technique du monde peut rester lettre morte si elle n’est pas mise au service de l’idée.]⁶³

Franck’s three primary maxims were:

Don’t try to do a great deal, but rather seek to do *well* no matter if only a little can be produced. Bring me the results of many trials that you can honestly say represent the very best you can do. Don’t think that you will learn from my corrections of faults of *which you are aware* unless you have strained every effort yourself to amend them.⁶⁴

Louis de Serres, whose expressive delicateness Franck particularly appreciated, confirmed that

no one better than he knew how to make his students understand a strictly severe organ style [...] at the same time deeply felt and expressive.

[mais nul mieux que lui ne savait faire comprendre à ses élèves ce que peut être un style de l’orgue strictement sévère [...] en même temps profondément senti et expressif.]⁶⁵

Franck did not use a particular method or follow any strict rules, but orally gave each student personal advice. According to Albert Mahaut,

he spoke little, in small phrases, but we sensed the deepness of his soul, his greatness, his energy, at the same his penetrating sweetness.

[il parlait peu, en phrases brèves, mais tout de suite nous avons deviné la profondeur de son âme, sa grandeur, son énergie, en même temps que sa douceur pénétrante.]⁶⁶

His innate perceptive intuition enabled him to understand each student’s personality, temperament, capabilities, strengths and weaknesses. Whatever their level, Franck deeply loved teaching and instilled in each student his impassioned ardor and love of musical beauty. As Charles Tournemire expressed:

Never did one leave this seraphic musician demoralized; but certain observations, said in a few words, generally gently and penetrating, striking and exact, enlightened the soul and warmed the heart.

[Jamais on ne sortait démoralisé de chez le musicien séraphique ; mais, certaines observations, dites en peu de mots, généralement doux et pénétrants, frappants et justes, éclairaient l'âme et réchauffaient le cœur.]⁶⁷

César Franck had a great influence on my artistic philosophy. I owe him the calm and the courage which strengthens artists... If he lived for transcendent art, he knew nevertheless how to help those who came to him.

[César Franck a eu sur la philosophie de mon art une influence très grande. Je lui dois le calme et le courage qui trempe les artistes... S'il vivait pour l'art transcendant, il savait néanmoins se pencher sur la vie de ceux qui venaient à lui.]⁶⁸

Extremely generous, Franck did not accept any payment from talented students who needed money more than himself, such as Henri Büsser, whom Franck asked to substitute for him at Sainte-Clotilde.⁶⁹ His class was like a family reunion. Léonie Guinrange met her husband, Marcel Rouher, there. His lack of pride and his joy of accomplishing his everyday tasks with

constant optimism emanated from his perfect kindness, his incapacity to experience any resentment or jealousy; his ongoing cheerful nature

[un optimisme incurable, né de sa bonté parfaite, de son incapacité d'éprouver rancune ou jalousie, et, aussi, une gaîté foncière...]⁷⁰

was a consolation and encouragement to all his students, who deeply respected him.

According to Joël-Marie Fauquet, the following musicians were auditors in his organ class:⁷¹

Ca. 1870 (?): Camille Rage

Ca. 1872: the Romanian Maurice Cohen-Lânariou

Ca. 1875: Georges Bizet⁷² (1839-1875), Henri Kunkelmann (1855-1922), Albert Renaud (1855-1924)

1876: Julien Tiersot (1857-1936)

1879: Ernest Chausson (1855-1899)

1880: Paul Vidal (1863-1931), the American, Raymond Huntington Woodman (1861-1943)

1880-1881: the French and Argentinian Herman Bemberg (1859-1931), Bessand, Claude Debussy (1862-1918), Fernand Leborne (1862-1929), Jules-Gaston Melodia

1880-1885: the Englishman John Hinton⁷³ (1849-1922) [organ], Paul Dukas (1865-1935)

1888: Anne-Berthe Merklin (Mme Lambert des Cilleuls, daughter of Joseph Merklin) (1866-1918) [piano and organ]

1889: Mlle De Mailli [harmonium and organ], Louis Vierne

It is likely that some of his other private organ students attended his organ class there, such as Charles-Auguste Collin⁷⁴ (1865-1938), Saint-René Taillandier (who died in 1931), Many of his composition and piano students during these years could have attended his courses:

1872: Alexis de Castillon (1838-1873), Albert Cahen d'Anvers (1846-1903)

1872-1875: Henri Duparc (1848-1933), one of his most talented students [ca 1863-ca 1875], Urban Le Verrier (1811-1877)

1873: Arthur Coquard (1846-1910), Mlle de Jouvencel [piano]

Ca. 1875: Edmond Diet (1854-1924), Marguerite Habert [piano], Augusta Holmès (1847-1903), Henri Kunkelmann (1855-1922), Charles Langrand (1852-1942) [piano and composition?]

1876: Mel-Bonis, Mélanie Bonis (Mme Albert Domanche) (1858-1937) [piano]

1878: Mme Charles Poisson [piano]

Ca. 1880: Raymond Bonheur (1861-1939), Paul Braud [piano], Laure Fleury [piano, year uncertain], Joséphine Haincelin [piano], Marguerite Hamman [piano], Léon Husson, Mlle

Javal [piano], Henry Lerolle (1848-1929), ?Fernand Fouant de La Tombelle (1854-1928), Léo Luguët (1864-1935), H. Kervel [organ and piano?], Georges Rosenlecker, Gustave Sandré (1843-1916) [composition, piano and organ?, year uncertain], Alice Sauvrezis (1866-1946) [piano, year uncertain], Gaston de Vallin [piano?], Paul de Wailly (1856-1933)
 1881-1887: Pierre de Bréville (1861-1949)
 Ca. 1885: Charles Bordes (1863-1909), Cécile Boutet de Monvel (1864-1940) [piano], Paul Carré de Malberg [composition?], Paul Dukas (1865-1935), Henri Expert (1863-1952), Marie Fabre, Mme Soullière [piano and composition], Henry Huvey (died in 1944) [organ], Sylvio Lazzari (1857-1944) [born in Austria], Mme Édouard Lefébure [piano], Charles Pierné [harmonium], Henri Quittard (1864-1919), Guy Ropartz (1864-1955), Georges Saint-René Taillandier (1852-1942) [year uncertain], Théophile Ysaye (1865-1918) [piano, brother of Eugène]
 1887: Stéphane Gaurion [a private organ student?]
 1887-1890: Erik Åkerberg (1860-1938) [Swedish], Jules Écorcheville (1872-1915)
 1888: Mlle Olympe Rollet [piano]
 1889: Charlotte Danner [piano], Mme Saint-Louis de Gonzague [piano], the Argentinian Alberto Williams (1862-1952)⁷⁵
 Ca. 1889-1890: Guillaume Lekeu (1870-1894)
 Ca. 1890: Clotilde Bréal (1870-1947) [one of Franck's favorite piano and organ students, to whom he dedicated his *First Choral*, in the copy that belonged to her second husband, Alfred Cortot], Frank [Franz] Godebski (1866-1948).

Franck truly had the ability to understand each student's capacities and needs, which often led to liberal conclusions that were quite different from the formalism of other professors at the Paris Conservatory. In 1880-1881, when Claude Debussy attended his class as an auditor for six months to obtain his advice in composition, Franck had confided to him,

The fifths, there are some nice ones... At the Conservatory one does not allow that... But I myself, I love it well!

[Les quintes, il y en a de jolies ; il faut savoir en faire ! Au Conservatoire on ne permet pas cela... Mais moi, je l'aime bien !]⁷⁶

As Erik Kocevar indicated, Gustave Derepas really understood Franck's teaching when he confirmed that instead of imposing his own musical ideas on his students, he let each of them follow their own paths:

Radically setting aside a personal and intolerant biased opinion, the master penetrated with a rare sagacity of his students' thoughts. ... How remarkable! Musicians trained in his school of thought all possessed a solid science that can be qualified as profound; but each maintained his own personality. The master was so respectful of the inspiration of others!

[Mettant radicalement de côté le parti pris, l'“à priori” personnel et l'intolérance, le maître pénétrait avec une rare sagacité dans la pensée des disciples. ... Chose remarquable ! Les musiciens formés à son école possèdent tous une science solide et l'on peut dire profonde ; mais chacun a gardé son tempérament personnel. Le maître était si respectueux de l'inspiration d'autrui !]⁷⁷

To thank him, Franck's students wholeheartedly supported him. They deeply respected their Master, referred to him as a *Pater Seraphicus*. and developed a doctrine known as “Franckism.” [Franckism]⁷⁸ Many of them contributed to the fact he received the *Légion d'honneur* on 6 August 1885 during the distribution of prizes at the Conservatory, in gratitude for his fifteen years of service there.⁷⁹ In spite of his Germanic origins, many of them revered him as a true renovator of French music, labelled as *ars gallica*, according to the motto of the *Société nationale*, which Franck presided over in 1886. Just to give one example, in 1879, Camille Benoît encouraged him by publishing several articles on his works in the *Gazette musicale* and the *Guide musical*. His students organized and paid for a Festival Franck which was given at the *Cirque d'Hiver*

on 30 January 1888. Unfortunately, their complaints to Ambroise Thomas that Franck had not been appointed as a composition professor at the Paris Conservatory created much hostility, for which Franck was not responsible.⁸⁰ Also, Vincent d'Indy had interpreted Franck's noble character as a sort of religious absolutism that "obeyed the three theological virtues known as Faith, Hope and Charity," [obéit aux lois des trois vertus théologiques qui ont nom Foi, Espérance, Charité]⁸¹ to which Franck's son Georges was totally opposed. According to Maurice Emmanuel, "Franck was never pious and he was not a practicing Christian." [Franck ne fut jamais pieux et sa vie religieuse ne s'astreignit guère aux pratiques.]⁸² One of his favorite books, which had inspired his *Beatitudes*⁸³ was the *Life of Jesus* (published in 1863)⁸⁴ by Ernest Renan, a close friend of Pauline Viardot. César Franck had meditated and was "guided" [guidé la sienne]⁸⁵ by Christ's *Beatitudes*, since 1845; he had completely set them to music thirty years later. However, although Art goes hand in hand with Religion, due to its essentially noble character, Franck's teaching was not religious in nature, but it was deeply spiritual. He simply desired to mold his students' capacities to express themselves musically, with noble grace, in order to become true genuine Artists.

The Repertory of Franck's Organ Students

What organ repertory did Franck's students play and how did they play it? Many of them indicated that he did not give them any indications concerning tempi, style, technique and registrations.⁸⁶ Under François Benoist, organ students had to play a memorized fugue by Bach. Let us examine if this is true by beginning with their repertory, which was founded on the works of the great master J. S. Bach, the absolute spiritual reference for these budding organists. They played the following Bach works during their exams and competitions:⁸⁷

Played once: *Well-Tempered Keyboard I: Fugues in: C-sharp Minor, BWV 849; F Minor, BWV 857 / Well-Tempered Keyboard II: Fugues in: C Minor, BWV 871; D Major, BWV 874, D-sharp Minor, BWV 877; E Major, BWV 878; F Minor, BWV 857/2 or BWV 881; Fugue in A-flat Major, BWV 862 or BWV 886; B-flat Minor, BWV 891, Aria in F Major, BWV 587, Concluding Fugue of the Passacaglia in C Minor, BWV 582; Canzona and Fugue in D Minor, BWV 888 / Eight Little Preludes and Fugues: Prelude in E Minor, BWV 555 / Fantasy in C Minor, BWV 562 / Fantasy and Fugue in G Minor, BWV 542 / Pastorale in F Major, BWV 590; Preludes in: E Minor BWV 533; G Major, BWV 568 / Fugues in: C Major, BWV 545, either BWV 564 or BWV 566, BWV 564; C Minor (unspecified); D minor (unspecified) / Toccata (Adagio and Fugue in C Major), BWV 564; Allegro from the 1st Movement of the Trio Sonata N° 1, BWV 525.*

Played twice: *Well-Tempered Keyboard I: Fugue in B-Flat Minor, BWV 867 / Eight Little Preludes and Fugues: Fugue in E Minor, BWV 555/2, Preludes and Fugues in: G Major, BWV 557; G Minor, BWV 558; B-flat Major, BWV 560 / Preludes in: C Minor, BWV 546; D Major, BWV 532; G Major, BWV 541; B Minor, BWV 544 / Fugues in: D Minor, BWV 539, E Minor ("Wedge"), BWV 548, F Major, BWV 540; F Minor, BWV 534; G Minor, BWV 131a; B Minor on a Theme by Corelli, BWV 579; B Minor, BWV 544 / Fantasy in G Minor, BWV 542 / Passacaglia in C Minor, BWV 582 / Prelude and Fugue in E Minor, BWV 533 / Toccata in D Minor, BWV 565 / Toccata and Fugue in D Minor, BWV 565 / 1st movement of the Concerto in A Minor after Vivaldi, BWV 593 / Chorales: "O Lamm Gottes, unschuldig," BWV 656, "O Mensch, bewein dein Sünde gross," BWV 622.*

Played three times: *Prelude in E-flat Major, BWV 552 / Fugues in: C Major, BWV 566; C Minor on a Theme by Legrenzi, BWV 574; G Minor, BWV 542 / Preludes and Fugues in: C Major, BWV 566; C Minor, BWV 546 / Toccata in F Major, BWV 540 / last movement of the Concerto in A Minor after Vivaldi, BWV 593.*

Played four times: *Concerto in G Major after Prince Johann Ernst, BWV 592 / Fantasy in C Minor, BWV 537 / Fugue in C Minor, BWV 546 / Toccata in D Minor ("Dorian"), BWV 538.*

Played six times: *Concerto in A Minor after Vivaldi, BWV 593 / Fugue in G Minor ("Little"), BWV 578.*

Played eight times: *Fugue in C Minor, BWV 537.*

In 1887, Franck had prepared five volumes with thirty-one Bach pieces in a Braille edition for the National Institution for the Blind in Paris. It used heels, heel and toe crossings, finger, foot and hand substitutions, finger, foot and thumb glissandi, which favored a complete legato.⁸⁸ All the pieces included in this collection

were performed by Franck's students at the Paris Conservatory, except for the chorales "An Wasserflüssen Babylon," BWV 653, and "Wir glauben all an einen Gott, Vater," BWV 740. On the other hand, they had performed the following works which were not in Franck's Braille Edition of Bach's Organ Works: selections from the *Well-Tempered Keyboard I and II*, the *Aria in F Major*, BWV 587, the *Concerto in G Major* after Prince Johann Ernst, BWV 592, the *Fugue in G Minor*, BWV 131a, the *Pastorale in F Major*, BWV 587, the *Toccatina in D Minor* ("Dorian"), BWV 538 and the first movement (Allegro) of the 1st Trio Sonata, BWV 525.

Franck's ten students who had previously studied at the Niedermeyer School and at the National Institute of Blind Youth had immediately played Bach's virtuosic works: *Fugue in D Major*, BWV 532, (Albert Mahaut and Adolphe Marty), *Fugue in E Minor* (the "Wedge," played by Boulay), BWV 548, *Fantasy and Fugue in G Minor* (Mahaut) and won their First Prizes rapidly, except for Henri Letocart, who was not very talented. As at the Niedermeyer School, Franck's students likely used C. F. Peters' Edition of Bach's organ works. Many of his long-term students had begun with Bach's *Well-Tempered Clavier* and the *Eight Little Preludes and Fugues*. Franck had inscribed into John Hinson's copy of the *Well-Tempered Keyboard* numerous "optional" pedal indications for the first twelve preludes and fugues in this collection.⁸⁹ Bach's fugues were performed more than the preludes. Alkan's performance of Bach chorales and trio sonatas in his *Les Petits Concerts* in the Salons Érard between 1873 to 1880⁹⁰ certainly had inspired Franck's students to play the two chorales and a movement of a trio sonata.

In addition to their substantial Bach repertory, Franck's students had also played Handel's *Concerto in B-flat Major*, a short piece by Lemmens, Schumann's *Canonic Study in A-flat Major*, op. 56, N° 4 (played twice), and movements from Felix Mendelssohn's Sonatas, notably N° 6, based on the Lutheran hymn "Vater unser" [the Lord's Prayer], played six times. Franck's teaching, based on these German masters, was faithful to that of Alexis Chauvet, François Benoist and Charles-Valentin Alkan, who had composed works based on Protestant chorales, such as his *Impromptu sur le Choral de Luther*, ["Ein Feste Burg"], dedicated to François Benoist.

According to his composition student, Charles Bordes (1863-1909), "Father Franck was formed by his students." [Le Père Franck a été formé par ses élèves.]⁹¹ Franck's students, like those of François Benoist, had played Bach's works during their exams. Franck's students had thoroughly studied the construction of the Bach works, notably of his fugues, such as the combination of themes in the *Fugue in C Minor*, BWV 574,⁹² which truly inspired his students' improvisations and compositions, as well as those of his own, as shown in his *Prélude, Fugue and Variation, Grande Pièce Symphonique* and *Three Chorals*.⁹³ Bach's fugues were indeed "the model for all music." [le modèle de toute musique.]⁹⁴ During the bicentenary of J. S. Bach's birth in 1885, René de Récy, had indicated the importance of the fugue in Bach's works: "The fugue is [...] the first complete type of musical composition." [La fugue est [...] le premier type complet de la composition musicale.]⁹⁵ Mel Bonis, who attended his class as an auditor around 1878, remembers having heard him say "Bach is the oldest of the Future musicians." [Bach est le plus ancien des musiciens de l'Avenir.]⁹⁶ Also, for Franck, improvisation was an "authentic compositional act." [un acte compositionnel authentique.]⁹⁷ For two years, both Vincent d'Indy and Charles Tournemire considered it to be "an infinitely precious advantage to work in his organ class, a center of true studies in composition." [l'avantage infiniment précieux de travailler à la classe d'Orgue, centre véritable d'études de composition.]⁹⁸

Franck's students became true pioneers when they played their master's works, which were relatively unknown at that time. When Georges Bizet heard a student play his *Prélude, Fugue et Variation* during an exam, he confided to Franck, "Your piece is exquisite. I did not know that you were a composer." [Votre pièce est exquise. Je ne savais pas que vous étiez compositeur...]⁹⁹ The following fourteen students promoted and encouraged César Franck by performing his works for their exams and their competitions:

Adèle Billaut: *Prélude, Fugue et Variation* (January 1875)

Marie Renaud: *Prélude, Fugue et Variation* (July 1876)

Georges Verschneider: *Fantasy in C Major* (January 1874), *Pastorale* (January 1877); *Prière* (June 1877)

Henri Dallier: *Fantaisie in C* (June 1878)¹⁰⁰

Gabriel Pierné: *Final* (July 1882)

Henri Kaiser: *Grande Pièce Symphonique* (July 1884)

François Pinot: *Fantaisie in A* (June 1885)

Adolphe Marty: *Fantaisie in C* (June 1886)

Jean-Joseph Jemain: *Cantabile* (January 1887), the beginning of the *Pièce symphonique* (June 1887)
 Georges Aubry: *Cantabile* (June, 1888)
 Georges Bondon: *Prière* (July 1888), *Grande Pièce symphonique* (July 1889)
 Albert Mahaut: *Prière* (June 1889)
 Marie Prestat: *Prélude, Fugue et Variation* (July 1889), *Fantaisie en la* (January 1890) and *Prière* (July 1890)
 Henri Letocart: *Pastorale* (July 1890).

Franck's *Prière*, dedicated to François Benoist, was played four times, which duly rendered homage to Franck's predecessor.

Concerning the interpretation of these works, Charles Tournemire's indications in his book, *César Franck* prove that Franck did indeed deal with expressive interpretational matters. In accordance with his master's approach, he analyzes the basic form and structure of each piece, its musical expression, its tempos and its mystical meaning. For him, his master's *Prière*, the most remarkable of his *Six Pièces*, is an uninterrupted large fresco. Its *Andante sostenuto* theme is played at the tempo of 55 to the quarter note. Its animated central melismatic recitative sections, played with great liberty and at a livelier tempo, at 76 to the quarter note,

provide the necessary calm to express the initial theme when it returns with more ardent intensity. One must interpret its conclusion with fantasy.

[permet la détente nécessaire... Après cette trêve, quelle intensité dans le retour à la grande idée, et quel enveloppement enflammé ! ... La péroraison est du domaine de la fantaisie]¹⁰¹

Jean Langlais regretted that he never heard Albert Mahaut play it. Mahaut revered it so much that he had stopped playing it when he was seventy-five years old.¹⁰² The exquisite *Prélude, Fugue et Variation*, a sweet Bach-like cantilena, was dedicated to Camille Saint-Saëns. For Charles Tournemire, the *Andantino* should be played without rigor at the tempo of 60 to the quarter note, the *Fugue* at 88 and the *Variation* without haste, very clearly, "at the tip of your fingertips." [du bout des doigts]¹⁰³ In the *Grande Pièce Symphonique*, the first romantic sonata conceived for the organ, dedicated to Charles-Valentin Alkan, Tournemire provides the following tempos: the *Andante serioso* with the quarter note at 69, the *Allegro non troppo e maestoso* with a half note at 80; the quarter notes in the *Andante* at 60, in the *Scherzo-Allegro* at 96 and in the final *grand chœur* at 80; and the final fugue with a half note at 60, enlarging the tempo until the end. In the pure *Fantaisie en ut*, dedicated to Alexis Chauvet, the *Quasi lento* is "a small, calm intense poem;" [petit poème intense, recueilli;]¹⁰⁴ the quarter notes in its *Poco Lento* can be played at 66 without dragging and its pastorale-like *Allegretto cantando*, around 76, with great suppleness. Its calm contemplative final *Adagio* rejects any metronomic movement. In the charming *Pastorale*, the quarter notes of the *Andantino* are at 58; in the *Quasi Allegretto*, at 100, and slightly less rapidly during the exposition of the fugue. In the *Fantaisie en la*, the *Andantino's* quarter note is at 88 and the movement should fluctuate with much liberty; after the *Très largement*, at measure 214, one returns to the initial tempo with "a feeling of infinite calm" [dans un sentiment infiniment calme]¹⁰⁵ until its delicate ending. In the most remarkable *Cantabile*, with the general movement of a quarter note at 69, each interpreter should "follow his own interiority!" [selon l'intériorité de chacun !]¹⁰⁶

One must always remain faithful to the César Franck's musical intentions, which means that one may need to change the registrations and even rewrite the score. When Marie Prestat played Franck's *Pièce héroïque* on the studio organ at the Conservatory, since it has no 16-foot stops in the manuals, she had to play the piece's theme in octaves in the manuals, leaving out a low B which did not exist.¹⁰⁷ Organists must adapt the tempo of his *Prélude, Fugue et Variation* originally written for piano and harmonium, to the acoustics in churches and concert halls. André Marchal (1894-1980), who had studied with both Adolphe Marty and Albert Mahaut at the Institute for Blind Youth from 1909-1911, played Franck's works in a very supple and expressive manner. A true artist never plays music in the same manner, but continually evolves and adapts each of his interpretations to each particular situation, to each organ and to the building's acoustics. Given the liberty that Franck gave his students, they certainly played their master's works differently, also in accordance with their own personalities, but always very musically. Vital musical expression cannot be acquired by imitating others, but by understanding and expressing music freely and with conviction. According to Tournemire, Franck recommended his students "not to imitate him, but to

‘search’ [within ourselves].” [César Franck nous recommandait de *ne point imiter*, mais de nous ‘chercher.’”]¹⁰⁸ During his lessons, his only criteria, *I love it* and *I don’t love it*, made his students understand that music is a science of producing and hearing pleasant, enchanting sounds that deeply touch and transform humanity.

Each student’s repertory is very interesting. To give just one example, although Georges Verschneider had earned no organ prizes, he had difficulty improvising and his whitlow illness had prevented him playing his exam on 24 June 1878. Nonetheless, Franck found him to be a very interesting student and really appreciated his hard work, his distinctive interpretations and his innovative repertory. During his six years in Franck’s class (1873-1879), in addition to the above mentioned three Franck pieces, he played the following works during his exams: Bach’s *Fugue in C Minor*, BWV 546, the virtuosic *Fantasy and Fugue in G Minor*, BWV 542, and his *Prélude and Fugue in B Minor*, BWV 544 (each of these four pieces in separate exams), as well as the flamboyant *Toccata in F Major*, BWV 540. He was Franck’s first student to play the first movement of the *Trio Sonata N° 1*, BWV 525, and the Chorale, “*O Lamm Gottes, unschuldig*,” BWV 656, and Mendelssohn’s *Sonatas N° 3* and *N° 6*.

In order to play this repertory, Franck’s students had already acquired an excellent piano technique when they had entered his class, but they absolutely needed to acquire an excellent pedal technique as well. Since the Paris Conservatory had no practice instruments and they could not rehearse in churches, they were obliged to use pianos equipped with pedalboards. Pierre Érard began to rent them out in 1873.¹⁰⁹ Louis Vierne’s aunt Colin had purchased a Pleyel pedalboard for him in 1889, the year he had begun to attend Franck’s class.¹¹⁰ In addition, his students could practice in piano and organ manufacturing firms.¹¹¹

According to Henri Büsser: “To tell the truth, Franck neglected to teach technique, notably that of the pedalboard.” [À dire vrai, l’enseignement technique était assez négligé, notamment l’étude du pédalier.]¹¹² Was this true? While no written technical organ method by Franck is known, his approach to acquiring an excellent pedal technique is nonetheless revealed in Adolphe Marty’s *Art of the Pedal for the Great Organ*, published in 1891 and dedicated “To my Master, Monsieur César Franck, Organ Professor at the National Conservatory in Paris.” [À mon Maître, Monsieur César Franck, Professeur d’Orgue au Conservatoire National de Paris]¹¹³ In its Preface, Marty explains that

without the pedal, the sound of the Grand Organ is lacking in roundness and a full sonority, also because the more one is a walking virtuoso, the more one can achieve the true style of the organ, thus being able to play together all of its harmonic voices, because after all the execution of modern compositions especially requires a deep knowledge of manipulating this part of the organ.

[car le grand orgue, sans pédale, manque de rondeur et de plein dans la sonorité, car aussi plus on a de virtuosité pédestre, mieux on peut réaliser le vrai style de l’orgue, c’est-à-dire rendre concertantes toutes les parties harmoniques, car enfin l’exécution des compositions modernes exige particulièrement une connaissance approfondie du maniement de cette partie de l’orgue.]¹¹⁴

Divided into four series, the first series presents twenty-five exercises destined to give suppleness and equality to the pedal lines played by both feet, learning glissandi and substitutions. The second series deals with the equality of the toes, in order to play large intervals with the same foot, then presents the chromatic scale, the trill and the arpeggios. Highly musical, a manual accompaniment is added to each exercise that enables students to think harmonically and should be transposed into all the major and minor keys¹¹⁵: [[Orgelkunst p. 183](#)]

In the third series, one learns how to play octaves. The fourth series deals with the independence of the two feet, glissandi and substitutions, as well as scales and arpeggios, which should be practiced in fragments. Above all, this method was not based on Plainchant and was not applied to the harmonium, as in Lemmens’ Organ Method, but was closer in spirit to Alkan’s highly virtuosic *12 Studies for the Feet Only* (published by Richault ca.1866), which were dedicated to Louis James Alfred Lefébure-Wély, as was Franck’s *Final* with its long pedal solos. The following two brief excerpts illustrate the polyrhythms found in the pedal studies by Alkan and by Marty¹¹⁶: [[Orgelkunst p. 183](#)]¹¹⁷

Franck's students had certainly practiced on Alkan's grand concert piano in Pierre Érard's workshop at 13, rue du Mail because they had attended a performance of Franck's *Prélude, Choral et Fugue* for piano there.¹¹⁸ Louis Vierne, when he assisted Widor's organ class, beginning in 1894, gave courses on this piano, which had remained there after Alkan's death in 1888.¹¹⁹ One must remember that immediately following Alkan's death, Franck expressed his immense gratitude to him by transcribing for organ his *Thirteen Prayers*, op. 64, which he had composed in memory of Pierre Érard and which Richault had published in Paris in 1866.

How did César Franck's teaching differ from that of Charles-Marie Widor's? Widor had warned Louis Vierne about the attacks by Franck's former pupils against his reforms of their organ technique and confided to him:

“Concerning improvisation, I have nothing to change from what Franck taught you: he was the greatest improviser of his time... only some details in the forms, nothing in the procedures.”

[En ce qui concerne l'improvisation, je n'ai rien à changer à ce que vous apprit Franck : ce fut le plus grand improvisateur de ce temps... seulement quelques détails dans les formes, rien dans les procédés.]¹²⁰

For Vierne, while Franck was more severe in his requirements for the fugue than Widor, his interest in detailed melodic invention, harmonic discoveries, subtle modulations all valorized the musical expression.

For Widor, being a musician was not enough: one must be a virtuoso as well. In June 1891, before Jules Bouval played his exam, Widor mentioned that unfortunately he had not acquired a good organ technique. However, in January 1892, he observed that he had acquired the virtuosity that he was lacking during the preceding year. Henri Libert, who played mechanically, became an intelligent musician and an excellent virtuoso, performing Bach's *Toccata in F Major* in January 1892. In 1894, he won a First Prize in Organ in the same year as Louis Vierne. In addition, Charles-Marie Widor had encouraged his students to compete for the *Grand Prix de Rome*: Paul Ternisien, Jules Bouval and Henri Büsser, who won it in 1893. However, none of them won an Organ Prize. In January 1892, Ternisien was extremely nervous and lost control of himself during his exam, even though he had played Franck's *Cantabile*; Bouval was so upset that he did not compete in June 1894; Büsser, although he was very intelligent and a good musician, had difficulty improvising. Contrary to Widor, who was to become the *Secrétaire Perpétuel* of the *Institut de France* in July 1914, Franck had discouraged some of his students from attempting to go to Rome. In 1884, while Claude Debussy had won the *Grand Prix de Rome*, Franck's organ student, Henri Kaiser, had only received his First Prize in Organ. Only two of his “true” organ students, Samuel Rousseau and Gabriel Pierné, obtained the *Grand Prix de Rome*, in 1878 and 1882,¹²¹ Tournemire later expressed his gratitude to Franck, for having discouraged him to follow this path:

The most beautiful nature that I ever met, during my long career, was naturally that of Franck. I owe him my direction and how much I bless him each day for having advised me, when I began, to not dream of the Prix de Rome... Since then, I have had the time to reflect... I wonder what I would have become *if I had had the disrespect to not follow his advice*... I would have undoubtedly made conventional music, false theater, and I would have been lost... irremediably.

[La plus belle nature rencontrée par moi, au cours de ma déjà longue carrière, fut naturellement celle de Franck. Je lui dois mon orientation – et combien je le bénis chaque jour de m'avoir conseillé, alors que je débutais, de ne pas songer au prix de Rome... Depuis, j'ai eu le temps de réfléchir... Je me demande ce que je serais devenu *si j'avais eu l'irrespect de ne pas suivre ses conseils*... J'aurais fait sans doute de la musique conventionnelle, du faux théâtre, et je me serais perdu... irremédiablement.]¹²²

César Franck's Artistic Legacy

Many of Franck's organ students at the Paris Conservatory composed works of various genres:

Organ Works: Alfred Bachelet, Édouard Bopp, Joséphine Boulay, Jules Bouval, Henri Büsser, Auguste Chapuis, Hedwige Chrétien (even though she was not a liturgical organist), Henri

Dallier, Georges Deslandres, Vincent d'Indy, Dynam-Victor Fumet, Louis Ganne, Georges Guiraud, Georges Hüe, Henri Letocart, Henri Libert, Adolphe Marty, Gabriel Pierné, Marie Prestat, Paul Rougnon, Marcel Rouher, Samuel Rousseau, Francis Thomé, Charles Tournemire, Paul Vidal, Louis Vierne and Paul Wachs;

Religious vocal music: Joséphine Boulay, Georges Guiraud, Henri Letocart, Albert Pillard, Marcel Rouher, Achille Runner, Arnal de Serres and Théophile Sourilas;

Vocal works: Hedwige Chrétien

Piano Works: Bazile Benoît, Hedwige Chrétien, Aimé Féry, Louis Frémaux, Georges Guiraud and Carlos Mesquita;

Works for Harmonium and Piano: Marie Prestat and Théophile Sourilas;

Chamber Music: Auguste Chapuis, Hedwige Chrétien, Jean-Joseph Jemain and Marie Prestat;

Melodies: Amédée Dutacq, Georges Guiraud, Jean-Joseph Jemain, Henri Letocart, Carlos Mesquita, Albert Pillard, Marcel Rouher, Achille Runner, Arnal de Serres, Paul Ternisien, Paul Wachs;

Light Music: Émile Fournier;

Lyrical Works: Alfred Bachelet, Émile Fournier, Louis Frémaux, Cesar Galeotti, Jean-Joseph Jemain and Marie Prestat;

Operettas: Louis Frémaux and Louis Ganne;

Symphonic Works: Hedwige Chrétien, Cesar Galeotti, Jean-Joseph Jemain, Henri Letocart, Paul Wachs;

Music for All Genres: Camille Benoît, Pierre de Bréville, Henri Büsser, Auguste Chapuis, Henri Dallier, Vincent d'Indy, Cesarino Galeotti, Lucien Grandjany, Georges Hüe, Henri Kaiser, Adolphe Marty, Gabriel Pierné, Marie Renaud, Paul Rougnon, Samuel Rousseau, Jean-Ferdinand Schneider, Théophile Sourilas, Francis Thomé, Charles Tournemire and Louis Vierne;

Editions of Early Music: Auguste Chapuis and Vincent d'Indy (Rameau), Jean-Joseph Jemain (Baroque works); Henri Letocart (J.-B. Lully);

Transcriptions: Henri Büsser, Charles Tournemire, Louis Vierne and Paul Wachs.

Louis Vierne had transcribed for organ five of Franck's *Pieces for harmonium* (Pérégally et Parvy, 1901/Leduc, 1905); Charles Tournemire transcribed his *March* and the *Prelude of the Second Act of Ghiselle*, as well as the *Chanson de l'Hermine d'Hulda* (Choudens, 1927).

Some of Franck's students wrote books on harmony (André-Paul Burgat) or solfège manuals (Marie Renaud, Paul Rougnon). Paul Wachs wrote a manual on organ improvisation, in homage to his Master Monsieur César Franck, Organ Professor at the Paris Conservatory [en Hommage à son Maître Monsieur César Franck, Professeur d'Orgue au Conservatoire de Paris] as well as a treatise on Plainchant, written for organists who accompany the liturgy.¹²³ Some were members of the *Institut de France*: Georges Hüe, Officier d'Académie; André Paul Burgat; Louis Ganne, President of the SACEM. Auguste Chapuis was a music inspector. Jean-Joseph Jemain and Camille Benoît were music critics. Lucien Grandjany, Georges Guiraud, Georges Marty, Samuel Rousseau and Vincent d'Indy were choir directors. Louis Ganne, Jean-Joseph Jemain, Georges Marty and Gabriel Pierné and Vincent d'Indy were orchestra conductors. Alfred Bachelet succeeded Guy Ropartz as director of the Nancy Conservatory, who had been there from 1894-1919 before directing the Strasbourg Conservatory from 1919-1929; they both contributed to the decentralization of music. Some of his students became inspectors of music in the city of Paris, such as Auguste Chapuis (1895-1928).

Some of his other students became music professors. Paul Jeannin taught music and Cesarino Galeotti taught the piano in Parisian schools. Georges Guiraud taught harmony at the Toulouse Conservatory from 1912 to 1928). Bruno Maurel taught music in Marseille. Jean-Joseph Jemain was a piano professor at the Lyon Conservatory from 1888 to 1901. Henri Dallier taught the organ at the Niedermeyer School beginning in 1905. Henri Libert taught the organ there as well as at the American Conservatory in Fontainebleau from 1921 to 1937. At the Paris Conservatory, Paul Rougnon taught solfège; Marie Renaud (1876-1893), Lucien Grandjany (1883), Paul Vidal (1884); Hedwige Chrétien (in the class for women, 1890-1892), Henri Kaiser (1891) and Georges Bondon (1898) rehearsed it there. Louis Vierne assisted both Charles-Marie Widor and Alexandre Guilmant's organ classes (1894-1911). Paul Vidal taught accompaniment at the piano (1886) and composition (1910) there. Georges Marty taught the vocal ensemble

class (1892) and harmony (1904). Both Auguste Chapuis (1894) and Henri Dallier (1908-1928) taught harmony to women there: their student, Nadia Boulanger, then trained musicians from all over the world at the American Conservatory in Fontainebleau. Henri Büsser was a professor of vocal ensembles (1904-1930) and composition (1930-1948) there: his student, Gaston Litaize, highly appreciated his remarkable teaching. Like César Franck, Büsser recommended his students to “work, work, always work.” [le travail, le travail, toujours le travail.]¹²⁴ Charles Tournemire taught chamber music (1928-1935) there. In 1935, he severely corrected his private organ student from Liège, Pierre Froidebise, as his master César Franck had corrected him:

I read your music with interest. You have ideas, many ideas. You are only missing the art of presenting them with more subtlety (...). I am returning your works with several corrections... Accept them!! Don't get tense!! When for the first time, César Franck corrected my works at the beginning, I found that odious!!? Because he dared to alter my harmonies... And since, I have acknowledged the soundness of his remarks! (...) This may be learned. You have what may not be learned. Thank God....

[J'ai lu avec intérêt votre musique. Vous avez des idées, beaucoup d'idées. Il ne manque que l'art de les présenter avec plus de subtilité (...). Je vous retourne vos œuvres avec quelques corrections... Acceptez-les !! Ne vous raidissez pas !! Quand pour la première fois, César Franck me corrigea mes œuvres au début, je le trouvai odieux !!? Parce qu'il osait toucher à mes harmonies... Et depuis, j'ai reconnu le bien-fondé de ses remarques ! (...) Cela s'apprend. Vous avez ce qui ne s'apprend pas. Remerciez le ciel....]¹²⁵

From 1891-1899, Arthur Coquard, Franck's former composition student¹²⁶ directed the National Institute for Blind Youth, where three of César Franck's students also perpetuated his legacy: Adolphe Marty, Albert Mahaut and Joséphine Boulay. During the years Adolphe Marty was organ professor there (1888-1930), he opened up new horizons to an entire generation of blind organists, teaching them counterpoint and fugue, improvisation and the interpretation of the works of J. S. Bach. According to Louis Vierne, his open-minded and enthusiastic manner of teaching illustrated that of his Master, César Franck.

I found with joy my professors. Marty, always very affectionate, treated me like a friend, not like a student. He continued to largely make me profit from his experience as a student at the Conservatory and predicted a likely success in this establishment.”

[Je retrouvai avec joie mes professeurs. Marty, toujours très affectueux, me traitait en camarade, non en élève. Il continuait à me faire largement profiter de son expérience d'élève du Conservatoire et me prédisait une réussite certaine dans cet établissement.]¹²⁷

Albert Mahaut, who taught harmony there (1889-1924), wrote just after Franck was buried at the *Grand-Montrouge* Cemetery on 10 November 1890:

“We had encircled a tomb, it is true, but this tomb ought to be glorious... We gathered courage to work, each in our sphere, to the triumph of the master who, unknown during his lifetime, ought to be soon the object of enthusiastic acclamations.”

[Nous entourions une tombe, il est vrai, mais cette tombe devait être glorieuse, nous en avons l'intuition. Nous prîmes courage pour travailler, chacun dans notre sphère, au triomphe du maître qui, méconnu durant sa vie, devait être bientôt l'objet d'acclamations enthousiastes.]¹²⁸

Eight years after Franck's death, Albert Mahaut was the first to perform Franck's entire twelve organ pieces at the Trocadéro, on 28 April 1898 and in 1899. He played them again at the Saint-Léon Church in Nancy on 24 and 27 March 1905, the year he wrote his book, *César Franck*, and continued to perform them throughout his life. During his 53 years of volunteer social work for the Valentin Haüy Association for the Blind¹²⁹ (1890-1943), he developed the musical notation in Braille and encouraged young blind organists throughout France to study in Paris. Josephine Boulay taught harmony and piano there from 1888 to 1925.

This institution produced hundreds of other future church musicians, music professors and piano tuners. André Marchal, Augustin Barié, Gaston Litaize and Jean Langlais faithfully transmitted the teaching principles of Adolphe Marty and Albert Mahaud to an entire generation of blind organists, among them: Xavier Dufresse, Jean-Pierre Leguay, Antoine Reboulot, Georges Robert and Louis Thiry. André Marchal taught organ, improvisation there from 1919 to 1959 and Jean Langlais also taught organ there from 1930-1968. The actual organ professor there since 2002, Dominique Levacque, had studied in Rouen with Louis Thiry. In addition, André Marchal taught many private students, such as Marie-Claire Alain, the Scottish Susan Landale and the American Ann Labounsky. Jean Langlais also taught at the Schola Cantorum from 1961 to 1974, forming organists such as Pierre Cogen and Marie-Louise Jaquet-Langlais. Louis Vierne taught at the Paris Conservatory, transmitting his knowledge to students such as Marcel Dupré, who made his own editions of César Franck's works and then taught at the Paris Conservatory from 1926 to 1954. Gaston Litaize later taught at the Conservatory in Saint-Maur (1974-1990), where he was succeeded by his organ student, Olivier Latry, who, in 1985, became the youngest titular organist at the Notre-Dame Cathedral in Paris and, in 1995, was appointed organ professor at the *Conservatoire National Supérieur de Musique* in Paris.

In 1894, Charles Bordes, with the collaboration of Vincent d'Indy and Alexandre Guilmant, founded the "Schola Cantorum" and taught choral direction there. Vincent d'Indy directed it from 1900 to 1931. Pierre de Bréville taught counterpoint there from 1898 to 1902. Jean-Joseph Jemain was a piano professor there beginning in 1901. Marie Prestat taught the organ there in 1901-1902 and also the piano from 1901-1922. Louis Vierne also taught the organ there (1911-ca. 1925). Opposed to the academic programs at the Paris Conservatory and known for its high artistic morals, its monthly review, *La Tribune de Saint-Gervais*, published articles on religious music, as had the Niedermeyer School. After D'Indy's death in 1931, four of Franck's composition students were artistic advisers there (Gabriel Pierné, Paul Dukas, Guy Ropartz and Pierre de Bréville), along with Albert Roussel, resigned and founded the École César Franck on 7 January 1935. Louis d'Arnal de Serres directed it from 1935 to 1942 according to the spirit of Franck, with strictness and musicality. Among Édouard Souberbielle's organ students there, Michel Chapuis became the organ professor at the *Conservatoire National Supérieur de Musique* in Paris from 1986 to 1995.

Finally, in accordance with an 1870 modification of the article 29 at the Paris Conservatory, which had stipulated that the organ should be taught both technically and liturgically,¹³⁰ Franck had inspired and trained an entire generation of church musicians in Paris; several indications concerning his private students are indicated in brackets:¹³¹

Choirmasters and Organists at:

La Madeleine: Achille Runner (1904-1938)

Sainte-Anne-de-la-Maison-Blanche: Gabriel Fumet ([1914] or 1917-1948)

Saint-Denis-de-la-Chapelle: Joseph Humblot ([peut-être 1873]-mai 1903)

Choirmasters at:

[Notre-Dame d'Auteuil: Stéphane Gaurion]

Sainte-Clotilde: [Stéphane Gaurion (1869?-1875)]¹³², Samuel Rousseau (1882-1904)¹³³

Saint-Esprit Reformed Protestant Church: Jean-Joseph Jemain (beginning in 1901)

[Saint-Gervais: Charles Bordes (1890-1902), where he founded the *Chanteurs de Saint-Gervais* en 1892

Saint-Roch: Louis Landry¹³⁴ (beginning in 1897)

Saint-Vincent-de-Paul: Marcel Rouher (1890-1900)

Choir Accompanists:

Sainte-Clotilde: [Stéphane Gaurion (1863?-1869)], Samuel Rousseau (1870-1878); Dynam-Victor Fumet, (1879-1887)

Saint-Eugène: Albert Pillard (1900)

Sainte-Marie des Batignolles: Georges Deslandres (ca. 1900)

Saint-Germain l'Auxerrois: Marcel Rouher (1882-1910)

Saint-Philippe-du-Roule: Georges Bondon (in 1900)

Saint-Vincent-de-Paul: François Pinot (1887-1891) succeeded Léon Boëllmann, Lucien Grandjany (1891-1892) and Henri Letocart (1892-1900)

Titular Organists at:

La Madeleine: Henri Dallier (1905-1934), for whom Achille Runner substituted

- The Notre-Dame Cathedral: Louis Vierne (1900-1937)
 Notre-Dame-des-Champs: Auguste Chapuis (1884-1888)
 Sainte-Clotilde: Gabriel Pierné (1890-1898); Charles Tournemire (1898-1939)
 [Sainte-Trinité: Marie Prestat substituted for Alexandre Guilmant on 30 August 1896]
 Saint-Eustache: Henri Dallier (1878-1905)
 Saint-François Xavier: [Albert Renaud (1879-1891), Adolphe Marty (1891-1941)]
 Saint-Germain l'Auxerrois: Marcel Rouher (1910-1913)
 Saint-Jean-Saint-François: Georges Guiraud (1889-1896) [Camille Rage (1906-1919 ?)]
 Saint-Jean-Baptiste de Grenelle: Albert Pillard (1929)
 Saint-Joseph's English-speaking Catholic Church: Louis de Serres
 [Saint-Leu-Saint-Gilles: Camille Rage (1901-1906)]
 Saint-Louis-en-l'Île: François Pinot
 Saint-Mérri: Paul Wachs (1874-1896)
 Saint-Philippe-du-Roule: Cesarino Galeotti
 Saint-Pierre-de-Chaillet: Jules Bouval (1900-1914)
 Saint-Roch: Auguste Chapuis (1888-1906)
 Saint-Sulpice: Louis Vierne substituted for Charles-Marie Widor (1892-1890)
 Saint-Vincent-de-Paul: Albert Mahaut (1897-1899), succeeded Léon Boëllmann
- Some played in Parisian suburbs at:
- Charenton-le-Pont: Georges Guiraud
 [in Nogent-sur-Marne: Charles Bordes, organist and choirmaster (1887-1890)]
 Saint-Clodoald in Saint-Cloud: Henri Büsser (1892-1906) [Bruno Maurel substituted for him (1893-1895)]
 Saint-Nicolas in Issy-les-Moulineaux: Louis Ganne (in 1882)
 in Meudon: Albert Mahaut (1888)
 in Saint-Leu-la-Fôret: Vincent d'Indy (in 1874)
 Saint-Pierre in Montrouge: Albert Mahaut (1892-1897)
 Saint-Pierre de Neuilly: Henri Létocart organist and choirmaster (1900-1944); director of the chorale Society, *Amis des Cathédrales* (1912-1939)
 The Saint-Denis Basilica: Henri Libert (1896-1937)
- Some of his students were very active as organists in provincial cities, at:
- Saint-Pierre in Dreux: Henri Huvey (1887-1944); succeeded by his daughter Anne-Marie Huvey (1944-2005)
 Saint-Paul in Orléans: Marty (1887-1891)
 [Saint-Germain in Rennes: Charles-Auguste Collin]
 [Saint-Pierre in Rennes: Albert Renaud (1873-1878)]
 [Saint-Germain Parish Church in Saint-Germain-en-Laye: Albert Renaud (1891-1924), who had succeeded Saint-René Taillandier]
 [Saint-Rémy-de-Provence: Saint-René Taillandier (1891-1931?)]
 The Basilica in Saint-Quentin: Henri Rougnon (until 1934)
 Saint-Pierre in Toulouse: Georges Guiraud (1896-1912)
 Saint-Sernin in Toulouse: Georges Guiraud (1912-1928)
- [His private organ student, Raymond Huntington Woodman was Organist and Choirmaster at the First Presbyterian Church in Brooklyn, New York (1880-1941)]

Franck's following disciples played at the Sainte-Clotilde Basilica in Paris:

Samuel Rousseau was choir organist (1870-1878) then became choirmaster (1882-1904). His *Libera me*, premiered in 1885, was played during Franck's funeral. His *Fantaisie* op. 73 (1889, published in 1894), which closely resembles Franck's *Trois Chorals*, was dedicated "to the memory of his dear Master, César Franck." [à la mémoire de mon cher Maître César Franck]¹³⁵ After his father's death, Georges Franck entrusted him with the orchestration of the third act of *Ghiselle* and the revision of *Hulda*. In 1858, Franck had confided the catechism organ to Dynam-Victor Fumet in 1886.¹³⁶ Surnamed Dynam due to his dynamite playing, Franck had appreciated his original spirit and this had encouraged him:

I was still in César Franck's organ class [...] when I sought to make known a very rich music; also, I invented music with one beat time so that each beat rested on a rich harmony. The purpose of art, ... is to humanize the universal life, that is to say, to render it proportional to mankind's fallen kingdom.

[J'étais encore au Conservatoire dans la classe d'orgue de César Franck [...] lorsque je cherchais à faire connaître une musique très riche ; aussi j'inventais à faire connaître une musique très riche ; aussi j'inventais des compositions à un temps afin que chaque temps reposât sur une harmonie riche. Le but de l'art est d'humaniser la vie universelle, c'est-à-dire de la rendre proportionnelle au royaume déchu de l'homme.]¹³⁷

Gabriel Pierné began to substitute for Franck in 1882 and became his successor (1890-1898).

Charles Tournemire [ORGELKUNST, p. 187], Franck's true dignified disciple, succeeded Gabriel Pierné (1898-1939). In 1910, he dedicated his *Triple Choral (Sancta Trinitas)*, opus 41, "to the memory of my venerable Master César Franck." In 1930-1931, he became the first organist to record at the Sainte-Clotilde Basilica for the firm Polydor some of Franck's works (*Cantabile, Chant de la Creuse, Noël angevin* and the *Chorale in A Minor*) as well as five of his own improvisations (*Petite Rapsodie improvisée, Cantilène improvisé, Improvisation sur le Te Deum, Fantaisie-improvisation sur l'Ave Maris Stella* and *Choral-Improvisation sur le Victimae Paschali*), proving that interpretation and improvisation are inseparable.¹³⁸ Tournemire also prepared an edition of Franck's *L'Organiste* and the *Pièces Posthumes* with his own fingerings, metronome marks and annotations (Enoch, 1933: vol. 2 and 1934: vol. 1). Maurice Emmanuel, Franck's disciple who had not been his student, was choirmaster at Sainte-Clotilde from 1904 to 1907 thus described Tournemire's dignified succession to his master César Franck:

After the service had ended, the parishioners fled the church during the "postludes," which were true treasures, that César Franck played for them. Have times changed? Do the parishioners hear the artist who today (1926), through a close bond between the liturgy and art, and equally respecting the religious and musical functions, edified them on the themes taken from the service of the day, as noble, as disciplined in their structure as those by César Franck, of whom he was one of his last students? His master bequeathed to him the gifts of these contemplative and impassioned improvisations, sometimes calm, sometimes tumultuous, and which are like mystical dramas conceived in the secret recesses of the soul. The successor of the Master of the *Béatitudes* also retreats to the contemplation of labor, and comes out of his reserve only to give flight to the thousand voices of his organ, in a lyrical exhilaration, with which the congregation seems to associate little....

[Les paroissiens de Sainte-Clotilde s'enfuyaient pendant les « sorties » où César Franck, l'office achevé, leur livrait des trésors. Les temps ont-ils changé ? Les paroissiens écoutent-ils l'artiste qui aujourd'hui (1926) par une alliance étroite de la liturgie et de l'art, dans un égal respect de ses fonctions religieuses et musicales, édifie sur les thèmes issus de l'office du jour des constructions aussi nobles, aussi disciplinées dans leur structure, que celles de César Franck, dont il fut un des derniers élèves ? Son maître lui a légué le don de ces improvisations contemplatives et passionnées, tantôt sereines, tantôt tumultueuses, et qui sont comme des drames mystiques conçus dans les secrets replis des âmes. Le successeur du maître des *Béatitudes* s'enferme, lui aussi, dans le recueillement du labeur, et ne sort de sa réserve que pour donner l'essor aux mille voix de son orgue, dans une allégresse lyrique à laquelle l'assistance paraît peu s'associer....]¹³⁹

During the inauguration of a monument in homage to César Franck in the small garden placed in front of the Sainte-Clotilde Church on 22 October 1904, named as the Square Samuel-Rousseau in 1935, Théodore Dubois, the Director of the Paris Conservatory since 1896, expressed the Conservatory's gratitude to César Franck:

If there was, as one had pretended, some coldness, or rather some indifference of certain colleagues of César Franck, I ignore this, and even I do not believe it, but I insist on officially

proclaiming that the Conservatory is very proud to have counted among its professors such an artist, and the actual director considers it a great honor to have been his friend and colleague during all these years. And in my name and in the name of the Conservatory, I bring here a moving homage of admiration to the memory of a noble and powerful artist to whom we erect this monument today.

[S'il y eut, comme on l'a prétendu, quelque froideur, ou plutôt quelque indifférence de la part de certains collègues de César Franck, je l'ignore, et même je ne le crois pas, mais ce que je tiens à proclamer bien haut, c'est que le Conservatoire est très fier d'avoir pu compter parmi ses professeurs un tel artiste, et que le directeur actuel tient à grand honneur d'avoir été son ami et collègue pendant tant d'années.]¹⁴⁰

Conclusion

An ardent prolific music teacher, César Franck faithfully accomplished his duties as an organ professor at the Paris Conservatory, in spite of the poor quality instruments on which he taught. In this institution founded on the principles of liberty, equality and fraternity, he respected his students, understanding each one's potential, gave them practical advice, encouraged them to constantly work with rigor and guided them with suppleness in the right direction. To become accomplished artists, they had to acquire a solid pedal technique and internalize their musicianship by memorizing their repertoire, by realizing subtle plainchant accompaniments and by mastering the art of improvisation, which eventually enabled them to compose. J. S. Bach's music inspired and influenced the improvisations and compositions of both the master and his students. Franck's impassioned quest for artistic beauty and spiritual approach to teaching produced a lasting legacy.

¹ See Léon Vallas, *La véritable histoire de César Franck, 1822-1890* (Paris, Flammarion, 1955), 10, and Joël-Marie Fauquet, *César Franck* (Paris, Arthème Fayard, 1999), 42.

² See, Fauquet, 54.

³ Vallas, 19.

⁴ Fauquet, 120.

⁵ Fauquet, 464.

⁶ Cécile and Emmanuel Cavaillé-Coll, *Aristide Cavaillé-Coll* (Paris, Fischbacher, 1929), 92. C. Shuster Fournier translated the original French citations in this article.

⁷ This chapel was located at 12, rue de Clichy. Lefébure-Wély and Pierre Érard were witnesses at this ceremony. In addition to the other addresses mentioned in this article, Franck also lived at 6, rue de Trévise beginning in the spring of 1841 and at 43 rue Lafitte since the autumn of 1842. In 1865, his family moved to 95, boulevard Saint-Michel.

⁸ Composed in 1846, it was originally intended for his future fiancée, Félicité Desmousseau. See Fauquet, 54.

⁹ Félix Raugel, "La Musique religieuse française de l'époque révolutionnaire à la mort de César Franck," *La Revue Musicale*, N° 222, 1953-1954, 119.

¹⁰ Henri Maréchal, *Souvenirs d'un musicien* (Paris, Hachette, 1907), 171.

¹¹ Aristide Cavaillé-Coll, "Description de l'orgue actuel du Conservatoire impérial de musique," 12 March 1864, A.N. [Archives Nationales de France], F²¹ 1037.

¹² Aristide Cavaillé-Coll, "Letter to Eugène Gautier," 29 January 1858, published in Fenner Douglass, *Cavaillé-Coll and the Musicians* (Raleigh, N. C., Sunbury Press, 1980), vol. II, 997.

¹³ Vallas, 142.

¹⁴ Rollin Smith, *Playing the Organ Works of César Franck* (Stuyvesant, New York: Pendragon Press, 1997), 16.

¹⁵ L. Loiseau, "Souvenirs de Collège," *Le Galois*, 23 November 1903, published in Franck Besingrand, *César Franck, entre raison et passion* (Brussels, Peter Lang, 2022), 165.

¹⁶ See A. Cavaillé-Coll, *Traité proposé à Monsieur le Ministre des Cultes de l'Instruction publique, des Cultes et des Beaux-Arts*, 5 November 1870, A.N. AJ³⁷ 82, 4, and Jesse Eschbach, *Aristide Cavaillé-Coll, A Compendium of Known Stoplists*, vol. I (Paderborn: Verlag Peter Ewers, 2003), 726-727.

¹⁷ Charles Gounod, "Autograph letter to Monsieur le Curé," London, 13 March 1871, Private Collection; published in Shuster Fournier, *Un siècle de vie musicale à l'église de la Sainte-Trinité à Paris* (Paris, L'Harmattan, 2014), 42.

¹⁸ Fauquet, 406.

¹⁹ Fauquet, 466.

²⁰ See Fauquet, 471 and 834.

- ²¹ See Jules Simon, Arrêté pour le Secrétaire Général du département de l'Instruction publique des Cultes et des Beaux Arts, 31 janvier 1872, A.N., AJ³⁷ 69, 2, n° 7, and Charles Blanc, Le Directeur des Beaux-Arts, Membre de l'Institut, Lettre au Monsieur le Directeur [du Conservatoire National de Musique & de Déclamation], 17 février 1872, A.N., AJ³⁷ 69, 2, n° 4.
- ²² Albert Dupaigne, *Le Grand Orgue de la nouvelle salle de concert de Sheffield*, Paris, Plon et Cie., 1873, 48.
- ²³ Jules Lissajous, "Rapport sur l'orgue établi par Mr. Aristide Cavaillé-Coll dans la grande salle du Conservatoire de Musique de Paris," A.N., AJ³⁷ 82, 4d.
- ²⁴ A. Cavaillé-Coll, "Mémoire général des travaux du grand orgue de la salle des Concerts du Conservatoire de Musique de Paris," 12 January 1872, A.N., AJ³⁷ 82, 4d, stoplist also published in Eschbach, 338. According to Gilbert Huybens, *Aristide Cavaillé-Coll, Opus List*, p. 22, this organ was delivered on 29 January 1872.
- ²⁵ A. Cavaillé-Coll, "Letter to Monsieur Ambroise Thomas, Director of the Paris Conservatory," 5 December 1871, A.N., AJ³⁷ 82, 4.
- ²⁶ A. Cavaillé-Coll, "Mémoire general des travaux de reconstruction et de perfectionnement effectués à l'orgue d'Étude du Conservatoire de Musique à Paris," 24 October 1872, A.N., AJ³⁷ 82, 4d, included in Carolyn Shuster's Doctoral Thesis, *Les Orgues Cavaillé-Coll au salon, au théâtre et au Concert*, delivered in 1991 at the François-Rabelais University in Tours.
- ²⁷ Vierne, "Mes Souvenirs," *In Memoriam Louis Vierne*, Paris, Les Amis de l'Orgue, 1939, 21.
- ²⁸ Jules Lissajous, "Rapport sur l'orgue d'étude du conservatoire national de musique, reconstruit et perfectionné par Mr. A. Cavaillé-Coll," 25 October 1872, A.N., AJ³⁷ 82, 4d. The stops on the *Grand Orgue* keyboard, Eschbach, 349, indicates that the Flûte 8' and Prestant 4' have 30 notes without specifying that they are the upper 30 notes; Rollin Smith, 31, and Orpha Ochse cite Louis Vierne, who mentioned, in *Mes Souvenirs*, a Dessus de Montre 8' without indicating the Dessus of Flûte Harmonique and Prestant stops.
- ²⁹ See Fauquet, 408 and 471.
- ³⁰ Alexandre Cellier, *L'Orgue Moderne*, Paris, Delagrave, 1927, p. 106.
- ³¹ Vallas, 316.
- ³² Albert Mahaut, "Souvenirs personnels sur César Franck," *Musique et musiciens* (Paris, l'Institut National des Jeunes Aveugles, 1923), 586.
- ³³ Louis Vierne, in his *Journal II (Cahiers et Mémoires de L'Orgue, N° 135 bis, 1970)*, 162, mentions that his courses took place on Mondays and Thursdays at 2 p.m. and on Saturdays at 11 a.m., but in *Mes Souvenirs II (Cahiers et Mémoires de L'Orgue, N° 134 bis, III, 1970, 22)*, he indicates that they took place on Tuesdays, Thursdays and Saturdays from 8 to 10 a.m.
- ³⁴ A.N., AJ³⁷ 251.
- ³⁵ Prepared with: A.N., AJ³⁷ 283; Fauquet, 960-964.
- ³⁶ Vierne, in *Mes Souvenirs*, 24, mentions that he was admitted as a student on 4 October 1890. According to Widor's Report, 24 January 1891, A.N., AJ³⁷ 292, 54, he enrolled on 16 January 1891.
- ³⁷ Vallas, 174.
- ³⁸ See Eugène Gigout, "Concerts et Soirées," *Le Ménestrel* (XLIV), N° 45, 6 October 1878, 363.
- ³⁹ See Smith 37, who quotes "Nouvelles diverses," *Revue et Gazette musicale de Paris* (10 November 1878), 367.
- ⁴⁰ Henri Letocart, "Quelques Souvenirs," *L'Orgue*, N° 36 (December 1938), 2-7; 37 (March 1939), 4-6.
- ⁴¹ Orpha Ochse, *Organists and Organ Playing in Nineteenth-Century France and Belgium* (Bloomington, Indiana University Press, 1994), 209, quoting Gabriel Fauré, "Souvenirs," *La Revue musicale*, N° 3 (October 1922), 3-9.
- ⁴² Jacques-Nicolas Lemmens, *École d'Orgue basée sur le Plain-Chant Romain*, B. Schott's Söhne, 1862, 2.
- ⁴³ Marie-Louise Boëllmann-Gigout, "L'École Niedermeyer," in *Histoire de la musique 2*, under the direction of Roland-Manuel, *Encyclopédie de la Pléiade* (Paris, Gallimard, 1963), 854.
- ⁴⁴ Henri Büsser, "La classe d'orgue de César Franck en 1889-1990," *L'Orgue*, N° 102, 1962, 33.
- ⁴⁵ *Ibid.*
- ⁴⁶ It was founded by Valentin Haüy in 1794 and was located on the boulevard des Invalides. Louis Briaille (1809-1852), organist and professor at this institute had developed the musical writing for the blind in 1829. Its organ class had been founded in 1826.
- ⁴⁷ Had Franck recalled that forty years previously his first music teacher, Dieudonné Duguet, had become blind in 1835, the year Franck had left the Liège Conservatory?
- ⁴⁸ Alban Framboisier, "The compositions of Auguste Tolbecque (1830-1919)," text of the CD Jacket in *Homage to Auguste Tolbecque* (Netherlands, Passacaille, 2019), 19-22.
- ⁴⁹ See Fauquet, 475.
- ⁵⁰ Vincent d'Indy, *Ma Vie* (Paris, Séguier, 2001).
- ⁵¹ Odile Jutten, "L'Évolution de l'enseignement de l'improvisation à l'orgue au Conservatoire," in Anne Bongrain, and Alain Poirier, eds. *Le Conservatoire de Paris: Deux cents ans de pédagogie, 1795-1995* (Paris: Buchet/Chastel, 1999), 83. Also quoted in David McCarthy, "Organ Teaching at the Paris Conservatoire," www.davidmccarthy.com, 3.
- ⁵² Vallas, 327-328.
- ⁵³ Vierne, *Mes Souvenirs*, 23.
- ⁵⁴ Jutten, 85.
- ⁵⁵ Théodore Dubois, Thèmes notés pour les examens d'orgue au Conservatoire de Paris, A.N., AJ³⁷ 237, 3.
- ⁵⁶ Smith, 41.
- ⁵⁷ Vallas, 319.
- ⁵⁸ Maurice Emmanuel, *César Franck* (Paris, Henri Laurens, 1930), 106-108.
- ⁵⁹ Vallas, 319.
- ⁶⁰ Emmanuel, 106.
- ⁶¹ Vierne, *Mes Souvenirs*, 45.
- ⁶² J. Bernac, "Interview with Mlle. Augusta Holmès," *The Strand Musical Magazine*, 1897, Vol. 5, 136, quoted in Florence Launay, *Les Compositrices en France au XIXe siècle* (Paris, Arthème Fayard, 2006), 56.

- ⁶³ Emmanuel, p. 113.
- ⁶⁴ John W. Hinton, *César Franck. Some Personal Reminiscences* (London, William Reeves, n.d.), 43, quoted in Smith, 43.
- ⁶⁵ Louis de Serres, "Quelques souvenirs sur le père Franck, mon maître," *L'Art musical*, 29 November 1935, 68, quoted in J.-M. Fauquet, 477.
- ⁶⁶ Vallas, 329.
- ⁶⁷ Tournemire, 70.
- ⁶⁸ *L'Orgue*, N° 321-324, 2018 – I-IV, LXX and 8.
- ⁶⁹ Büsser, p. 34.
- ⁷⁰ Emmanuel, 15-16.
- ⁷¹ Fauquet, 960-964.
- ⁷² This laureate of a First Prize in Organ in 1875 came to listen to Franck's class and distributed tickets to his students who were lucky enough to attend the premiere of *Carmen* on 3 March at the *Opéra-Comique*.
- ⁷³ According to Ochse, 159, John Hinton studied privately with Franck in 1865, 1867 and was an auditor in his organ class in 1873.
- ⁷⁴ See Charles Augustin Collin, "César Franck et la musique bretonne," *Le Nouvelliste de Bretagne*, August, 1912.
- ⁷⁵ The author thanks Vera Wolkowicz for kindly communicated this to her.
- ⁷⁶ Vallas, 322.
- ⁷⁷ Gustave Derepas, *César Franck / Étude sur sa vie, son enseignement, son œuvre* (Paris, Fischbacher, 1897), 27; quoted in Erik Kocevar, "Ses élèves et son enseignement," in *César Franck (1822-1890), Revue Européenne d'Études Musicales*, N° 1, 1991, Paris, Éditions Le Léopard d'Or, p. 41-42.
- ⁷⁸ Vallas, 341.
- ⁷⁹ Vallas, 234.
- ⁸⁰ Vallas, 323.
- ⁸¹ Fauquet, 22.
- ⁸² Emmanuel, 12.
- ⁸³ Vallas, 306.
- ⁸⁴ Fauquet, 315.
- ⁸⁵ Emmanuel, 12.
- ⁸⁶ Jacques Viret, "César Franck vu par ses élèves," *La Tribune de l'Orgue*, 1990, N° 3, 11, quoted in Fauquet, 477.
- ⁸⁷ Prepared with: A.N., AJ³⁷ 283 and Stinson, *J. S. Bach at His Royal Instrument* (New York, Oxford University Press 2021), 159-172.
- ⁸⁸ Karen Hastings, "New Franck Fingerings Brought to Light," *The American Organist*, N° 12 (December 1990), 92-101.
- ⁸⁹ See Stinson, 74.
- ⁹⁰ Constance Himelfarb, "Chronologie," in *Charles-Valentin Alkan*, sous la direction de Brigitte François-Sappey (Paris, Arthème Fayard, 1991), 21.
- ⁹¹ Vallas, p. 244.
- ⁹² *Ibid.*
- ⁹³ Vallas, "César Franck," *Histoire de la musique*, Encyclopédie de la Pléiade (Paris, Gallimard, 1960), 894, and Stinson, 81-88.
- ⁹⁴ Joël-Marie Fauquet and Antoine Hennion, *La grandeur de Bach* (Paris, Arthème Fayard, 2000), p. 115.
- ⁹⁵ Cited in Fauquet and Hennion, 115. See René de Récy, "Jean-Sébastien Bach et ses derniers biographes," *Revue des deux mondes*, 15 XI 1885, 406-427.
- ⁹⁶ Mel Bonis, *Souvenirs et Réflexions* (Paris, Éditions du Nant d'Enfer, s.d.) 38, quoted by Norbert Dufourcq in *L'Orgue*, N° 185 (1983), 5, by Fauquet, 574, and by Fauquet and Hennion, 132.
- ⁹⁷ Fauquet, 485.
- ⁹⁸ Tournemire, 70. Après la mort de Franck, Tournemire a étudié la composition avec Vincent d'Indy à la Schola Cantorum.
- ⁹⁹ Tournemire, 72.
- ¹⁰⁰ On 1 June 1889, Henri Dallier performed the *Prélude, Fugue et Variation*, at the Trocadéro for the World's Fair.
- ¹⁰¹ Tournemire, 24.
- ¹⁰² Jean Langlais, "Propose sur le style de César Franck dans son œuvre pour orgue," *Jeunesse et Orgue* [Automne 1878, 6], mentioned in Smith, 134.
- ¹⁰³ Tournemire, 23.
- ¹⁰⁴ Tournemire, 21.
- ¹⁰⁵ Tournemire, 25.
- ¹⁰⁶ Tournemire, 26.
- ¹⁰⁷ Viret, 11, cited in Fauquet, 179.
- ¹⁰⁸ Tournemire, 63.
- ¹⁰⁹ See François Sabatier, "L'œuvre d'orgue et de piano-pédalier," in *Charles Valentin Alkan*, 233, and in Georges Guillard, "Le piano-pédalier," *R.I.M.F.*, N° 13, February 1984.
- ¹¹⁰ Vierre, *Mes Souvenirs*, 20.
- ¹¹¹ According to Gustave Lyon, "Letter to Ambroise Thomas," 31 October 1893, A.N. AJ³⁷ 81 12, In 1893, this Director of the Pleyel, Wolff et Cie. Firm opened his workshop to Widor's students and gave such a pedalboard to the Conservatory.
- ¹¹² Busser, 33-34.
- ¹¹³ Marty, *L'Art de la Pédale du Grand Orgue* (Paris, Mackarr et Noël, 1891/Philippo et M. Combre, 1958), on the cover. It was printed in braille just after Franck's death.
- ¹¹⁴ Marty, 1.
- ¹¹⁵ Marty, 22.

- ¹¹⁶ Sabatier, 240.
- ¹¹⁷ Marty, 37.
- ¹¹⁸ Mahaut, "Souvenirs personnels sur César Franck," Bibliothèque Valentin Haüy in Paris, MTP1³⁸, 4066, 587.
- ¹¹⁹ Vierne, *Journal*, 165.
- ¹²⁰ Vierne, *Journal*, 164.
- ¹²¹ See Fauquet, 491.
- ¹²² Tournemire, "Letter to Alice Lesur," *L'Herbe*, 21 Septembre 1930, Collection Christian Lesur, published in "Mémoires de Charles Tournemire," Critical Edition by Jean-Marc Leblanc, *L'Orgue*, N° 321-324, 2018 – I-IV, XXI. At least three of Franck's organ students received the *Grand Prix de Rome*: Samuel Rousseau (1878), Gabriel Pierné (1882) and Henri Büsser (1893).
- ¹²³ Paul Wachs, *L'organiste improvisateur : traité d'improvisation*, Paris, Schott [1878], *Petit traité de plain-chant*, Paris, Énoch [undated].
- ¹²⁴ Alain Litaize, *Fantaisie et Fugue sur le nom de Gaston LITAIZE, Souvenirs et témoignages* (Delatour France, 2012), 38.
- ¹²⁵ Tournemire, *Letter to Pierre Froidebise*, 17 April 1935 (published in *Pierre Froidebise*, "Grande rencontre : Charles Tournemire," Exposition itinérante, Art & Orgue en Wallonie, undated), 13. Pierre Froidebise took private organ and composition lessons with Charles Tournemire in his Parisian home beginning in April, 1935.
- ¹²⁶ Arthur Coquard (1846-1910), a composer, was also a Doctor in Law and a music critic for *Le Temps* and *L'Écho de Paris*. He wrote *Franck* in 1890.
- ¹²⁷ Vierne, *Journal II*, 157.
- ¹²⁸ Mahaut, 588.
- ¹²⁹ This Association was founded in 1889 by Maurice de la Sizeranne. Albert Mahaut succeeded him as its Director (1918-1943).
- ¹³⁰ See Fauquet, 476.
- ¹³¹ This list was established thanks to See Pierre Guillot, *Dictionnaire des organistes français des XIXe et XXe siècles* (Sprimont, 2003) and the kind assistance of Vincent Thauziès from the Archives Historiques de l'Archevêché de Paris.
- ¹³² See Denis Havard de la Montagne and Shuster Fournier, "Maîtres de chapelle et organistes de la Basilique Sainte-Clotilde," in "La Tradition musicale de la Basilique Sainte-Clotilde de Paris," *L'Orgue*, N° 278-279, 2007 – II-III, 5.
- ¹³³ Samuel Rousseau also directed the women's choir at the *Société des Concerts* at the Paris Conservatory.
- ¹³⁴ He was also a Choir Director at the *Opéra-Comique*.
- ¹³⁵ Kurt Lueders, "Samuel Rousseau : simple figure marginale ou témoin privilégié d'un 'Esprit Sainte-Clotilde' ?," in C. Shuster Fournier, *L'Orgue*, N° 278-279, 2007 – II-III, 23.
- ¹³⁶ See Guillot, 223. According to Shuster Fournier, "Les instruments à claviers d'accompagnement de la Basilique Sainte-Clotilde," published in Shuster Fournier, 159. He likely accompanied on a Victor Mustel harmonium, either his Model 39 which had been acquired by the church on 1 September 1861 and which was still located in one of the chapels of this church in 1994, or his Model K, which the church had acquired in 1885.
- ¹³⁷ Philippe Rambaud, "D.-V. Fumet," *Bibliothèque des Lettres françaises*, N° 4, 15 February 1914, published in Pierre Guillot, 223.
- ¹³⁸ See Joël-Marie Fauquet, *Catalogue de l'œuvre de Charles Tournemire* (Geneva, Minkoff, 1979), 99. These five improvisations were reconstituted by Tournemire's disciple Maurice Duruflé and published by Durand in 1958.
- ¹³⁹ Emmanuel, 124.
- ¹⁴⁰ Julien Tiersot, "Inauguration du monument de César Franck," *Le Ménestrel*, N° 44 (30 October 1904), 34, and in Théodore Dubois, *Souvenirs de ma vie*, annotated by Christine Collette-Kléo (Lyon, Symétrie, 2009), 194.